

# National Baseline Study for Developing a model of inclusive education in Bangladesh project based on secondary data 

Researcher
M. Tariq Ahsan

Associate Professor
Institute of Education and Research (IER)
University of Dhaka
Dhaka, Bangladesh

April, 2013

Plan Bangladesh Quality Primary Education Programme

## April 2013

National Baseline Study for Developing a model of inclusive education in Bangladesh project based on secondary data
Editor :Iqbal Hossain, Advisor - Quality Primary Education Program, Plan Bangladesh
Coordination and Management:Mustakima Khanam, Inclusive Education Coordinator, Plan Bangldesh
Supported by:Monjur Al Khaled, Education Specialist, Plan BangladeshMohammad Kamruzzaman Kalam, Inclusive Education Coordinator, Plan BangldeshMuhammad Monirul Islam, ECCD Coordinator, Plan Bangldesh
Cover Design:
Aminul Islam
Graphics Design:
Aminul Islam
Solayman Hossain
Printed at:
00000000
Published by:
Quality Primary Education Programme
Plan Bangladesh
House \# CWN (B) 14, Road \# 35
Gulshan-2, Dhaka-1212, Bangladesh
Phone: (8802) 9860167, 8826209, 8817589
Fax: (8802) 9861599
Email: plan.bangladesh@plan-international.org

Disclaimer: Plan is committed to ensuring the security, privacy and dignity of all the children that we work with. All copyrights $\bigcirc$ reserved. No part of this publication/photo may be reproduced, stored in retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means without prior permission of Plan Bangladesh. Please email: plan.bangladesh@plan-international.org for more information.

## PREFACE

Inclusive education is now considered as a global agenda to reduce exclusion in education for diverse learners and to ensure quality education for all children. Addressing exclusion in education and reaching the most marginalized groups is also a priority agenda for Plan International. Following this, Plan Bangladesh is striving to develop an effective, participatory and inclusive primary education implementation model by involving all credible actors through its Quality Primary Education (QPE) program. This national baseline study on inclusive education based on secondary data has been conducted with a view to design a project titled Developing a Model of Inclusive Primary Education in Bangladesh under QPE program. This report aims to address findings of a systematic secondary literature review on inclusive education in Bangladesh.

The study has contributed in exploring policy gaps related to inclusive education in Bangladesh, unveiled the overall status of children with disabilities in education and in other social contexts, identified current research trends regarding inclusive education and explored the barriers and challenges to achieve inclusive education in Bangladesh. The findings of the study will not only support in designing the proposed project but will also be useful for all who are interested in this field. This was strongly felt when Plan Bangladesh disseminated the study in front of all actors including government in January, 2013. The study suggests specific recommendations based on the findings. As a result plan Bangladesh decided to publish the study so that this learning could reach a wider audience. The study was conducted by Associate Professor M. Tariq Ahsan who is from the faculty at the Institute of Education and Research (IER) of the University of Dhaka. Plan Bangladesh strongly appreciates him for his quality efforts in conducting this study.

Plan Bangladesh believes that the findings of the study will contribute in understanding the exclusion of some children from education in Bangladesh and that this will serve as a guideline for policy makers, researchers and practitioners of inclusive education in Bangladesh to undertake required steps to review/revise policies as well as reform and/or develop appropriate model of inclusive education in the country.


Country Director
Plan Bangladesh

April 2013

## Acronyms

| AAB | Action AID Bangladesh |
| :--- | :--- |
| ABC | Assistance for Bind Children |
| ACIE | Asian Centre for Inclusive Education |
| ADD | Action on Disability and Development |
| AID | Action In Development |
| AIEC | Access and Inclusive Education Cell |
| AJIE | Asian Journal of Inclusive Education |
| AusAID | Australian Agency for International Development |
| B.Ed | Bachelor of Education |
| BSEd | Bachelor of Special Education |
| BANBEIS | Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics |
| BDF | Bangladesh Dristhihin Foundation |
| BEKAS | Basic Education Kit to Access in School |
| BISE | Bangladesh Institute of Special Education |
| BPF | Bangladesh Protibondhi Foundation |
| BRAC | Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee |
| CAMPE | Campaign for Popular Education |
| CBBS | Cox's Bazar Baitush Sharaf |
| CBR | Community Based Rehabilitation |
| CDD | Centre for Disability in Development |
| C-in-Ed | Certificate in Education |
| CPD | Continuous Professional Development |
| CRC | Convention on the Rights of the Child |
| CRP | Centre for Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed |
| CSID | Centre for Services and Information on Disability |
| CSP III | Country Strategic Plan III |
| DLPIE | Distributed Leadership Practice for Inclusive Education |
| DPEd | Diploma in Primary Education |
| DFID | Department For International Development |
| DPE | Directorate of Primary Education |
| DSHE | Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education |
| DSS | Department of Social Services |
| ECCD | Early Childhood Care and Development |
| EFA | Education For All |
| ESTEEM | Effective Schools Through Enhanced Education Management |
| FSP | Female Secondary School Stipend Project |
| GBUC | Gram Bangla Unnyan Committee |
| GIEP | Government Integrated Education Programme Initiatives for Special-needs Bangladesh |
| GPS | Government Primary Schools |
| IE | Inclusive Education |
| IER | InsB |


| ILFE | Inclusive Learning Friendly Environment |
| :---: | :---: |
| JICA | Japan International Cooperation Agency |
| MDGs | Millennium Development Goals |
| MOE | Ministry of Education |
| MOPME | Ministry of Primary and Mass Education |
| MOWCA | Ministry of Women and Children Affairs |
| MSW | Ministry of Social Welfare |
| NAEM | National Academy of Educational Management |
| NCTB | National Curriculum and Text Book Board |
| NDP | National Development Programme |
| NEP 2010 | National Education Policy 2010 |
| NFOWD | National Forum of Organizations Working with the Disabled |
| NGO | Non Government Organization |
| NPA II | National Plan of Action Phase II |
| NRAS | Noakhali Rural Action Society |
| OHCHR | Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights |
| PEDP II | Second Primary Education Development Program |
| PEDP III | Third Primary Education Development Program |
| PES | Primary Education Stipend project |
| Plan BD | Plan Bangladesh |
| PTI | Primary Teachers' Training Institute |
| QPEP | Quality Primary Education Program |
| RDSS | Rangpur Shamajik Unnayan Sangstha |
| RNGPS | Registered Non-government Primary Schools |
| ROSC | Reaching Out-of-School Children |
| SACIE | Sentiments, Attitudes, Concerns regarding Inclusive Education |
| SAHIC | Society for Assistance to Hearing Impaired Children |
| SARPV | Social Assistance and Rehabilitation for the Physically Vulnerable |
| SBK | Shishu Bikash Kendra |
| SIP | School Improvement Plan |
| SLIP | School Level Improvement Plan |
| SMC | School Management Committee |
| TDI | Teacher Development Institute |
| TEIP | Teacher Efficacy for Inclusive Practice |
| TQI-SEP | Teaching Quality Improvement in Secondary Education Project |
| TTC | Teachers' Training College |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNCRPD | UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities |
| UNESCO | United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization |
| UNICEF | United Nations Children's Fund |
| UPEP | Upazila Primary Education Plan |
| URC | Upazila Resource Centre |
| USAID US | Agency for international Development |
| WB | World Bank |
| WHO | World Health Organization |
| YPSA | Young Power in Social Action |

## Table of Contents

Chapter Title ..... Page No.

1. Preface ..... ii
2. Acronyms ..... iii
3. Executive Summary ..... vi
4. Introduction ..... 1
5. Review of Literature ..... 4
6. The Context of The Plan Bangladesh Initiatives ..... 9
7. Objectives of The Study ..... 11
8. Methodology ..... 12
9. Findings of The Study ..... 16
10. Analysis and Discussion ..... 59
11. Recommendation \& Conclusion ..... 64
12. References ..... 70
13. Appendixes ..... 76

## Executive Summary

## Background

Bangladesh, like many other countries throughout the world is attempting through inclusive education reform to address the inequities in access and quality of education for all students. International policy levers such as Education For All (EFA) (DPE \& CSID, 2002), the Salamanca Declaration (UNESCO, 1994), Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) (United Nations, 2008); and the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UN Enable, 2008) have influenced national policies such as the National Plan of Action Phase II (NPA II) 2003-2015 (MOPME, 2003) and education system initiatives that include inclusive education as a reform strategy. Examples of these include the Second Primary Education Development Program (PEDP II) in the primary education sector and the Teaching Quality Improvement (TQI) in the secondary education sector. These initiatives signal the government's intent to enact the principles of improving learning for all students. This study aimed to determine the recent updates and the overall situation of policies, strategies, capacities, implementation and practices on inclusive education in Bangladesh with a focus on disability.

## Methodology

A systematic secondary document analysis procedure was followed in this study. This procedure allowed the researcher to search data systematically, select documents by following a specific guidelines and then analyse and synthesize information from relevant secondary sources.

## Major Findings

a. Policy Status. One of the specific objective of the study was to determine the overall policy status and strategic directions of government on inclusive education with a focus on disability. This study found that Bangladesh showed its commitments to implement inclusive education by being the signatory of all the international declarations related to human rights, equity, education, inclusive education as well as the declarations on rights of persons with disabilities. The reflection of the commitments were articulated through enacting several Acts and policy documents for all Bangladeshi citizens to ensure their equal rights in every aspects of life including education. However, conversely, some discriminatory clauses in the policy documents (such as, the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990, National Child Policy 2011) are found that need to be revised to remove the contradiction and confusion. It has been also recommended that further clarification is needed to clear some of the stand points of the National Education Policy 2010, National Child Policy 2011, Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act to develop a cooperative and collaborative approach between inclusive and special educational settings. On the other hand, the Draft Persons with Disabilities Rights Act 2011 and the comprehensive ECCD policy were found to be very significant document to promote inclusive education. Therefore, the study recommended the importance of enacting those documents by the government.

## April 2013

One key finding of the study was that the inequitable trends found in the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 was followed in the PEDP II and somehow in PEDP III also though a revision is going on under PEDP III to update the inclusive education framework and training package of PEDPII. This is about a discriminatory position against inclusion of children with severe and profound disabilities into education. The concept of mild to moderate disability that explained in the PEDP II document is also need to be revised as it not capturing the standardized and accepted definition.
b. Status of children with disabilities. The study also explored the overall situation of children with disabilities including nature, type and level of disability, number and their geographical locations. The review of secondary documents reported that there is no reliable census done to identify people with disabilities properly. Therefore, this study suggested a purposive sampling model for future studies related to inclusive education. WHO claimed that the percentage of disability among people have increased dramatically in last 35 years and estimated that the current percentage of people with disability is $15 \%$ of any given population (WHO, 2012). A comparatively acceptable finding was presented by a series of baseline surveys conducted first in four, and then in five locations covering 46,874 and 94,260 people respectively by ActionAid Bangladesh (AAB) between the time period of $1995-97$. These surveys reported that overall prevalence rates of disability were $14.4 \%$ and $13.34 \%$. Recent Primary School Census 2010 of DPE (2011b) identified 83023 children having disabilities (in which 35994 were girls) and types of children with disabilities enrolled in primary education explored as having Poor Eyesight (12455), Short of hearing (5541), Intellectual/mental (19683), Problem in speech (18927) and Physical handicap (26417).

Regarding education situation, DPE and CSID (2002) study reported that only $11 \%$ of the respondents received access to some sort of education in Bangladesh. Therefore, the majority were left out of any type of education. Among the children who were enrolled in education, children with physical disabilities were the most ( $55 \%$ ), followed by the children with hearing and speech disabilities at $15 \%$. The children with visual and intellectual disabilities had enrollment rate of $13 \%$ and $10 \%$ respectively. The Primary School Census 2010 of DPE (2011b) also reported that only children with mild disabilities were enrolled in the primary schools totaled 83,023 of which 47,029 were boys and 35,994 were girls. This census claimed slight increase of the enrollment of children with mild disabilities since it was found in the Baseline Survey in 2009, in which the total was 45,680 (DPE, 2011b). Despite such claim of increase, still the enrollment of children with disabilities in primary education is very low ( $0.97 \%$ of total student population) considering the total number of children $85,63,133$ enrolled in primary education. Recent Bangladesh Primary Education Annual Sector Performance Report 2012 (DPE, 2012) of the Government of Bangladesh claimed that five types of children with disabilities (physical, visual, hearing, speaking and intellectual) have been enrolled into education and their enrollment rate was increased by $5 \%$ per year compared to the baseline level in 2005.
c. Educational approaches and initiatives available. Three types of educational approaches provided by the Government and NGOs in Bangladesh: Inclusive schools,
integrated schools and special schools. Along with government initiatives, nongovernment initiatives including CDD, CRP, Sightsavers, IISB, CSID, TDI, ACIE were identified by the study. The study also explored existing potential platforms for promoting inclusive education. The study also reviewed the pre-service and in-service teacher education curriculums in Bangladesh through the lens of inclusive education. The review found that other than the Secondary B.Ed curriculum all the curriculums promote medical model of inclusion and require a revision to adopt social model.

From the review of recent studies on inclusive education it was found that pre-service and in-service teacher education require curriculum and policy reform for preparing teachers adequately. National policies still need to address IE issues properly and correctly in some cases, female pre-service and school teachers are still not much confident than male teachers towards IE due to socio-cultural effects, previous contact and experience with people with disabilities contribute in developing positive attitudes among pre-service and in-service teachers, our schools still follow a very bureaucratic system of management which is a barrier to inclusive practices and some other challenges include lack of resources, negative attitudes non-cooperation of schools etc. Hence, these findings of the studies have to be considered seriously while implementing IE in Bangladesh.
The study found a good and significant trend to address inclusiveness in ECCD and preprimary initiative by government. It was prominent in the policy document as well as in the implementation instruments like pre-primary curriculum though further work need to be done. As early identification and early intervention is really critical to minimize complexity and maximize development, this growing trend of making ECCD inclusive will add value to the whole inclusive education initiative of Bangladesh.

The study found that appropriate screening tool and process is a prominent need so that the tool does not promote medical model rather it identifies potentials and abilities and educational needs of children with disabilities. Moreover, a well-planned referral service is needed for confirmation of supports required for children with disability for ensuring their educational activities.
d. Barriers and Challenges of Inclusive Education. The study tried to document the barriers and challenges of inclusion in Bangladesh from different secondary sources which can be further explored to see the current dynamics of exclusion. These will give practical directions to design program and interventions that might be useful to maximize the result. Study also captured the prominent research and theories about recent updates on inclusive education in Bangladesh which need to be reviewed while designing program or revise policies and strategies on inclusive education.

Based on the overall review of documents, the study found that Bangladeshi education system requires a practical demonstration of inclusive education at school level through development of model schools. Therefore, the study also recommended a 'must follow' guideline for the development of those model schools at primary level regarding inclusive education.

April 2013

## Chapter 1

## Introduction

Over the last few decades, the educational reforms towards inclusive education for meeting learning needs of all learners in the same classroom have gained a significant attention by countries across the world. In making such educational reform happen United Nations has played the vital role by enacting several international declarations, conventions and frameworks. Among those international policy levers that contributed in gaining momentum in inclusive educational reforms, the Education For All (EFA) (UNESCO, 1990) comes foremost. The EFA 1990 first declared that all nations around the world have to ensure equal right to education for all citizens. Then in 1994 the Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education (UNESCO, 1994) formally accepted the values of inclusive education as a strategy to ensure education for all learners in the same classroom. Later on the Dakar Framework for Action (UNESCO, 2000) reviewed the achievements and failures of EFA declaration and again mentioned the necessity of implementation of inclusive education to ensure education for all learners. In addition, Millennium Development Goals [MDGs] (United Nations, 2008) also articulated the rights of all citizens into education. More recently, the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities-UNCRPD (UN Enable, 2008) in its Article 24 stated that it is the responsibility of all signatory states to ensure inclusive education opportunities for all citizens.

UNESCO (2009) defines inclusive education as a "process aimed to offering quality education for all while respecting diversity and the different needs and abilities, characteristics and learning expectations of the students and communities, eliminating all forms of discrimination" (p.18). Therefore, it is expected that the values of inclusive education would ensure such environment in schools that should be free from the effects of negative forms of discrimination based on gender, disability, culture, ethnicity, religion or differences arising from student's socio-economic and or geographic backgrounds (UNESCO, 1994). However, it is still reported that mainstream schools as well as teachers feel less confident in including children with special needs in their programs (Forlin, Loreman, Sharma, \& Earle, 2009; Kim, 2011; Shade \& Stewart, 2001). As a result, inclusive education aims to readdress these specific inequities with a view to ensuring that all children have access to high quality teaching and learning.

Like many other countries around the world, Bangladesh has responded to the international declarations and gone through a number of policy reforms to promote inclusive education. Bangladesh made primary education compulsory for all children by legislating the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 (Ministry of Primary and Mass Education [MOPME], 1990). Moreover, Bangladesh enacted the Bangladesh Persons with Disabili-

## April 2013

ties Welfare Act (Ministry of Social Welfare [MSW], 2001) in 2001. The act emphasized the need to educate children with disabilities either in mainstream or special schools. Besides, Bangladesh developed the National Plan of Action Phase II (NPA II) 2003-2015 (MOPME, 2003) for ensuring primary education for all citizens. Several policies as well as educational reform initiatives that include the implementation of the values of inclusive education were taken by the government in recent years (Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007, Ahsan, 2006). Examples of these include the Second Primary Education Development Program (PEDP II) in the primary education sector and the Teaching Quality Improvement (TQI) in the secondary education sector. More recently, The Education Policy 2010 recognized inclusive education as a viable strategy to ensure education for all citizens (Ministry of Education [MOE], 2010). To operationalise the policies and commitment, government of Bangladesh is currently implementing one of the biggest sector wide programs named PEDP III. Besides, 100\% enrollment in primary school by 2012 and ensuring quality is a political commitment and priority agenda for current government.

Situated in South Asia and being one of the most densely populated countries in the world (population density 962 persons/sq. km ., and its population is estimated to be 160 million), Bangladesh is facing various challenges to ensure the rights of every citizen into education. According to the DPE (2012) annual report, the net enrolment rate was calculated to be $98.7 \%$, which is claimed to be a success milestone of the government as the net enrolment increased from the past, as was $95.6 \%$ in 2010 and $87.2 \%$ in 2005. Since the DPE \& CSID (2002) study, there is no study that published a valid nationwide education data related to children with disabilities. However, the DPE \& CSID (2002) study claimed that despite a number of policy initiatives to ensure education for all, 89 percent of children with disabilities is left out of education in Bangladesh. Of those who attend schools, a large majority frequently dropout within first few months or years. In addition to that, only $22 \%$ children from the indigenous communities completed primary education during 2004 (Sarker \& Davey, 2009). There are still more than 3.2 million out of school children and opportunities for schooling are limited for specific groups, including hard-to-reach children: children with special needs, children in remote areas [Char, Haor-baor, flood prone area, disaster prone area etc.], children living in extreme poverty, children living in slum areas and working children which is a big challenge.

Reviewing the status of excluded groups, it comes out that children with special needs are comparatively the most marginalized in terms of access to education. The World Health Organization suggests $21 \%$ of children in Bangladesh aged 2-9 have a disability of some types (UN Enable, 2008), [including categories of cognitive, motor, visual, hearing and communication difficulties] which represents a much bigger group than those identified. This not only means many children with disabilities are out of school, but that many children may be enrolled but not identified as having any special needs. So schools or systems are not addressing those needs and for that education becoming difficult to them
from many perspectives. It highlights the need for a clear system at school level for identification and support children with special educational needs and learning difficulties. This is also supported by the results of a pilot intervention under the PEDP II in 9 Upazillas involving teachers in the use of a screening tool to identify children with certain types of disability that identified $11 \%$ of the enrolled children as being in need of some form of special supports (UNICEF State of the World's Children, 2009). Considering the findings it is proved that there are large number of children within the schools and out of school who can continue their education if their needs identified successfully and provided educational supports from all related stakeholders like parents, community, school and government. Hence, undoubtedly it is a must that the Government of Bangladesh increases the efforts of collaboration with different non-government organizations and development partners to ensure education of such large population who are currently out of education. Moreover, it is a necessity to explore the situation of inclusive education policy initiatives and identify the current practices for implementing the principles of inclusive education in the context of Bangladesh.

## Chapter 2

## Review of Literature

## International context of Inclusive Education

Over the last few decades, the educational reforms towards inclusive education for meeting learning needs of all learners in the same classroom have gained a significant attention by countries across the world. In making such educational reform happen United Nations has played the vital role by enacting several international declarations, conventions and frameworks. Bangladesh is signatory of those international declarations along with other countries of the world. The following section describes in brief the international context of inclusive education.

## The universal declaration of human rights

The General Assembly of the United Nations developed the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. This declaration proclaimed to achieve an universal standard of education for all nations. Specifically, Article 26 discussed about the right to education for all people around the world. These articles declared that elementary education should be free and compulsory. Besides, this article also ensured the right of parents to decide the kind of education for their children. Such strong utterances in the declaration have facilitated later on the development of policies that promote the values of inclusive education around the world.

## Article 26

(1) Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.
(2) Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.
(3) Parents have a prior right to choose the kind of education that shall be given to their children.
(United Nations, 2012)

## UN convention on the rights of the Child (1989)

United Nations adapted the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) in 1989 and it was ratified by all most all the nations of the world. The CRC has been revised several times since its inception and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) in the UN is involved in such process. The CRC through its several articles ensured the rights of every child to participate in different development and recreational initiatives without any discrimination. Specifically, Article 2, 28, 29.1 etc. are some examples that have significant contribution in developing inclusive environment in every aspect of life including education. The following paragraphs present some of those articles:

## Article 2

1. States Parties shall respect and ensure the rights set forth in the present Convention to each child within their jurisdiction without discrimination of any kind, irrespective of the child's or his or her parent's or legal guardian's race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national, ethnic or social origin, property, disability, birth or other status.
2. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to ensure that the child is protected against all forms of discrimination or punishment on the basis of the status, activities, expressed opinions, or beliefs of the child's parents, legal guardians, or family members.

## Article 28

1. States Parties recognize the right of the child to education, and with a view to achieving this right progressively and on the basis of equal opportunity, they shall, in particular:
(a) Make primary education compulsory and available free to all;
(b) Encourage the development of different forms of secondary education, including general and vocational education, make them available and accessible to every child, and take appropriate measures such as the introduction of free education and offering financial assistance in case of need;
(c) Make higher education accessible to all on the basis of capacity by every appropriate means;
(d) Make educational and vocational information and guidance available and accessible to all children;

Article 29.1
States Parties agree that the education of the child shall be directed to: (d) The preparation of the child for responsible life in a free society, in the spirit of understanding, peace, tolerance, equality of sexes, and friendship among all peoples, ethnic, national and religious groups and persons of indigenous origin.
(OHCHR, 2007)

By signing the CRC , the Government of Bangladesh has taken varieties of initiatives to ensure the rights of the children. One of the remarkable contribution was the National Children Policy 1994 which has been revised in 2011. This policy is an important commitment from Bangladesh to promote inclusive education.

## Education For All- EFA 1990 declaration:

Among those international policy levers that contributed in gaining momentum in inclusive educational reforms, the Education For All (EFA) (UNESCO, 1990) comes foremost. EFA 1990 in Jomtien, Thailand first declared that all nations around the world have to ensure equal right to education for all citizens, which can be considered as the founding policy framework for inclusive education. The Jomtien Declaration recommended to improve the quality of basic education for all primary school-age children and announced to ensure equity in education for girl children as well as other marginalised children. In response to EFA declaration (UNESCO, 1990), Bangladesh enacted the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 (Ministry of Primary and Mass Education [MOPME], 1990).

## The World Conference on Special Needs Education (Salamanca Declaration 1994)

The Salamanca Statement is considered to be the most significant international document for promoting inclusive education. UNESCO organized the World Conference on Special Needs Education in Salamanca in 1994 and enacted "The Salamanca Statement on Principles, Policy and Practice in Special Needs Education", which was signed by 92 governments and 25 international organizations. This statement raised the voice to include children with special educational needs into the existing framework of the "Education for All" (EFA) initiatives. As a result of such initiatives, inclusive education has gained its recognition as a strategy to achieving the goals of EFA. The Salamanca Statement proclaims that:

- every child has a fundamental right to education, and must be given the opportunity to achieve and maintain an acceptable level of learning,
- every child has unique characteristics, interests, abilities and learning needs,
- education systems should be designed and educational programmes implemented to take into account the wide diversity of these characteristics and needs,
- those with special educational needs must have access to regular schools which should accommodate them within a childcentred pedagogy capable of meeting these needs,
- regular schools with this inclusive orientation are the most effective means of combating discriminatory attitudes , creating welcoming communities, building an inclusive society and achieving education for all; moreover, they provide an effective education to the majority of children and improve the efficiency and ultimately the cost-effectiveness of the entire education system.
(UNESCO, 1994, p. viii-ix).
Bangladesh is one of the signatories of the Salamanca Framework and committed to implement the framework for making an inclusive school environment. One remarkable achievement of Bangladesh after signing the Salamanca Framework was 'Persons with Disabilities Welfare Policy 1996'. This policy helped to enact the 'Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act 2001'later on.


## Dakar Framework for Action (2000)

The Dakar Framework for Action was developed as an outcome of the meeting organized in Dakar, Senegal, in 2000 for assessment of the Decade of the EFA Goals. The Dakar Framework rearticulated that still children from marginalized groups, such as, poor children, children with special needs, girl children, refugees, children from ethnic minorities etc. are left out of education. As a result, this framework declared that by the year 2015, all children needs to be brought into and complete good quality primary education all over the world through implementing the values of inclusive education. Hence, the participating countries including Bangladesh committed to create a favorable policy as well as physical environment to ensure the inclusion of all children into education programs. Another significant achievement of the Government of Bangladesh after participating in the Dakar Framework was the 'Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act 2001' that created a valid legal ground for people with disabilities to claim the right to basic needs including education.

## Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2006)

The Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities also known as the UNCRPD was ratified by the United Nations General Assembly in March, 2006. This UNCRPD is considered to be another notable policy document to ensure rights of persons with disabilities around the world. The UNCRPD clearly articulated that every state party is responsible to ensure the implementation of inclusive education for achieving EFA. Specifically, Article 24.1 and 24.2 of this convention discusses the issues related to inclusive education in the following way:

```
Article 24: Education
1. States Parties recognize the right of persons with disabilities to education. With a view to realizing this right without discrimination and on the basis of equal opportunity, States Parties shall ensure an inclusive education system at all levels and lifelong learning directed to:
(a) The full development of human potential and sense of dignity and self-worth, and the strengthening of respect for human rights, fundamental freedoms and human diversity;
(b) The development by persons with disabilities of their personality, talents and creativity, as well as their mental and physical abilities, to their fullest potential;
(c) Enabling persons with disabilities to participate effectively in a free society
2. In realizing this right, States Parties shall ensure that:
(a) Persons with disabilities are not excluded from the general education system on the basis of disability, and that children with disabilities are not excluded from free and compulsory primary education, or from secondary education, on the basis of disability;
(b) Persons with disabilities can access an inclusive, quality and free primary education and secondary education on an equal basis with others in the communities in which they live;
(c) Reasonable accommodation of the individual's requirements is provided;
(d) Persons with disabilities receive the support required, within the general education system, to facilitate their effective education;
(e) Effective individualized support measures are provided in environments that maximize academic and social development, consistent with the goal of full inclusion.
(UN Enable, 2006, p. 16-17)
```

Bangladesh is a signatory country of the UNCRPD and in response to signing this document the Government is in the process of developing a Disability Discrimination Act and also implementing several projects to ensure inclusive education.

## Definition of Inclusive education: International context

Generally, Inclusive Education is considered as an educational endeavor to remove barriers in the education systems by welcoming all children into regular schools irrespective of their diversity. The Salamanca Framework (UNESCO, 1994) defines the target group of inclusive education as:

[^0]While defining the characteristics of an inclusive school, the Salamanca Framework (UNESCO, 1994) further articulates:

The fundamental principle of the inclusive school is that all children should learn together, wherever possible, regardless of any difficulties or differences they may have. Inclusive schools must recognize and respond to the diverse needs of their students, accommodating both different styles and rates of learning and ensuring quality education to all through appropriate curricula, organizational arrangements, teaching strategies, resource use and partnerships with their communities.
(UNESCO, 1994, p. 11-12
Inclusion is now considered more than just including children with disabilities into regular education (Booth, Nes, \& StrØmstad, 2003; Forlin, Cedillo and Romero-Contreras, 2010). Many educationists (e.g. Ainscow, 2005; Ballard, 2003; Sen 2005) opined that the broader objective of inclusive education is to achieve equity and social justice for all citizens in every aspect of life including education. Mel Ainscow (2003) defines inclusive education as,
"the process of addressing barriers to the presence, participation and achievement of pupils in local neighbourhood schools"

The recent guideline prepared by the UNESCO (2009) based on the International Conference on Education [ICE] 2008 described IE as a
"process aimed to offering quality education for all while respecting diversity and the different needs and abilities, characteristics and learning expectations of the students and communities, eliminating all forms of discrimination" (p. 18).

Hence, it is clear from reviewing the definitions of inclusive education that the values of inclusive education have broadened its radius beyond disabilities to include all children into education. Moreover, it is also important to note that inclusion does not mean just enrolling children into schools; rather it demands full and equal participation as well as completion of a quality education for all children.

## Chapter 3

## The Context of Plan Bangladesh Initiatives

Plan Bangladesh, a child centred international non-governmental organization, has been working to strengthen the mainstream primary education for about 15 years. Through its unique strategy named school improvement plan (SIP), Quality Primary Education Program-QPEP of Plan Bangladesh emphasises on access, governance and quality in primary education addressing all children regarding their race, culture, ability and gender. At present Plan BD is working with 275 mainstream primary schools, running more than 328 preschools (for 5-6years old children) and 1500 Shishu Bikash Kendra-SBK (For 3-5 years old children) in six districts named Dhaka, Gazipur, Nilphamari, Dinajpur, Lalmonirhat and Barguna. In this regard, to enhance the quality of learning, various supports are given to the mentioned primary schools, preschools and SBKs like teachers training, materials supply, children participation through library \& adolescent groups, school health \& sanitation support, awareness raising, advocacy with local and central government etc.

As mentioned, Plan Bangladesh is working for 3-11 years old children by addressing three different age groups through different interventions named SBK, preschool and primary school where inclusion is a compulsory issue as per Country Strategic Plan III (CSP-III) and global education strategy of Plan international. According to Plan's CSP III access, quality and governance are referred as key working areas for QPE program which shows Plan's passion to include all excluded children in to regular schools and continue their education with quality. Presently QPEP addressing inclusion issue in its working schools and centers with scattered activities. Ratio of boys and girls at primary schools, preschools and SBK is very satisfactory, children who have difficulty to achieve learning outcomes are receiving different academic supports according to their demands, enrolment rate is also satisfactory in Plan's working areas but Plan is struggling to develop a standard inclusive school where all stakes will be ready to play their roles to ensure quality education for all children specially for the children with disabilities. By this time, through its Quality Primary Education Program-QPEP, Plan is trying to raise awareness among the teachers, parents, communities \& education officials on enrolling children with disabilities and addressing their diverse educational and developmental needs but these are not sufficient to address the education of children with disabilities effectively. There are few institutions that claim to establish inclusive schools in Bangladesh. But there is no empirical study or data through which inclusiveness of those schools can be explored. Hence, nationally, it is a demand to develop empirical study-based replicable inclusive school models for ensuring quality education for all learners. It is evident that a comprehensive plan is required to make a school inclusive with all soft and hard resources and skills.

Now Plan Bangladesh is planning to design and implement a pilot project to develop a model inclusive school using mainstream primary school. This project will be designed and implemented in collaboration with DPE, UNICEF and specialized organization like CRP/CDD so that outcomes of this project can support PEDP III target of developing inclusive school by 2015.

Before conducting an in-depth study for designing the project as per contextual need, a stock taking of inclusive education initiatives from policy to implementation level or some sort of situational analysis for preparing a national baseline is necessary. This study will explore the situation of inclusive education in Bangladesh considering international context based on secondary data and information.

## Chapter 4

## Objectives of The Study

## Broad objective

The broad objective of the study is to determine the recent updates and the overall situation of policies, strategies, capacity, implementation and practice on inclusive education in Bangladesh with a focus on disability.

## Specific objectives

Specific objectives of the study are to:

1. Determine the overall policy status and strategic directions of government on inclusive education with a focus on disability
2. Determine the overall situation of children with disabilities including nature, type and level of disability, number and their geographical locations.
3. Determine what services and educational facilities and approaches conducted by government and others (NGO and private) throughout the country for out and in school children with disabilities.
4. Identify the existing and potential linkages, coordination between government policies/strategies/initiatives and other's effort considering the rights of children with disabilities;
5. Be familiar with main research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education
6. Identify main challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh

## Chapter 5

## Methodology

A systematic secondary document analysis was followed in this study. This procedure provides opportunity for the researcher to synthesize information from relevant secondary sources (Cohen, Manion, \& Morrison, 2007; Creswell, 2008). Systematic secondary data analysis has been reported by several studies (Avramidis and Norwich, 2002; Rose, Shevlin, Winter, \& O'Raw, 2010; Scruggs and Mastropieri, 1996) to be a very effective tool for exploring the context of a particular issue within a specific time-frame and/or in a country context. This review included a wide range of secondary documents and systematic data search procedure was followed to identify documents for review.

## Sources of secondary documents

Firstly, documents were searched online. Popular Search engines such as Google, Yahoo were used to search secondary documents. Key words that were used in searching relevant documents include two groups: key word-group includes (a) 'Legislation', 'Policy', 'Act', 'Education for All', 'Disability', 'children with disabilities' 'Gender', 'Working Children', 'Vulnerable children', 'Project', 'Report'. Each of the 'group a' key word would be combined with key word-group (b) 'Inclusive education in Bangladesh' while searching the documents online.

Other sources of secondary data include:

1. Websites of the relevant ministries and departments of the Government of Bangladesh:
a. Ministry of Law and Parliamentary Affairs
b. Ministry of Education (MOE)
c. Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME)
d. Ministry of Social Welfare (MSW)
e. Ministry of Women and Children Affairs (MOWCA)
f. Directorate of Primary Education (DPE)
g. Department of Social Services (DSS)

Websites of relevant NGOs (i.e. IISB, CAMPE, CDD, BRAC, ADD and more)
3. Websites of relevant development Partners (i.e. UNESCO, UNICEF, DFID and more)
4. Library documents of the Department of Special Education, Institute of Education and Research (IER), University of Dhaka, Inclusive Education Cell of the Directorate of Primary Education (DPE), Ministry of Primary and Mass Education, National Forum of Organizations Working with the Disabled (NFOWD),

> National Academy of Educational Management (NAEM), Centre for Services and Information on Disability (CSID), Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics (BANBEIS).
5. Monash University research projects on 'Inclusive education reforms in Bangladesh.

To find out relevant documents for review, key people responsible in the above mentioned sources were contacted and consulted. Based on their assistance, documents were collected for review.

## Literature selection procedure

In order to select relevant documents specifically the following criteria was used in this study:

- Documents and articles that have specific focus on inclusive education and disability issues in Bangladesh.
- Documents include government acts and policies, research reports, journal publications, reports on national educational programs and other available publications related to inclusive education in Bangladesh.
- Documents and articles published between 1990 and 2012.
- Studies related to inclusive education and disability published in peer-reviewed journals.

Based on the above mentioned criteria, in the second stage, documents were read intensively and reference lists of those documents were also be scrutinized by following the same criteria. From those initially selected documents, specific sections were selected for further analysis that had potential to achieve the objectives of this study. A list of documents that were reviewed in this study has been mentioned below.

1. The Constitution of Bangladesh
2. The Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990
3. The Persons With Disabilities Welfare Act 2001
4. National Education Policy 2010
5. National Child Policy 2011
6. Comprehensive ECCD Policy framework
7. Pre-primary education operational framework
8. Draft Disability Discrimination Act 2011
9. National Plan of Action Phase 2 (NPA II) of the Directorate of Primary Education
10. PEDP 2 Project Action Plans related to inclusive education

## April 2013

11. PEDP 3 documents related to inclusive education
12. TQI-SEP project documents related to inclusive education
13. Primary level pre-service (C-in-Ed) teacher preparation curriculum
14. Diploma in Primary Education (DPEd) curriculum
15. Secondary level pre-service (B.Ed) teacher preparation curriculum
16. In-service training manuals of DPE
17. NGO and development partners' reports related to disability and inclusive education
18. Research Reports related to inclusive education and disability in Bangladesh
19. Journal publications related to inclusive education and disability in Bangladesh.

## Analysis procedure

Broad and specific objectives of the study were used as a guideline for analysis of the secondary documents. The guideline includes the following issues that were explored through the secondary date analysis in this study:

- Overall policy status and strategic directions of the Government on inclusive education with a focus on disability
- Overall situation of children with disabilities; including their nature, type and level of disability, prevalence and their geographical locations in Bangladesh.
- Services and educational facilities and approaches conducted by the Government and others (NGO and private) throughout the country for out and in school children with disabilities.
- Existing and potential linkages, coordination between government policies/strategies/initiatives and other's effort considering the rights of children with disabilities;
- Prominent research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education
- Challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh

In addition, a conceptual frame known as the 'social model of inclusion' was used to analyze the content of the documents. Social model of inclusion postulates that inclusion is considered more than just physically including children with disabilities into regular education (Booth, Nes, \& StrØmstad, 2003; Forlin, Cedillo and Romero-Contreras, 2010). It is more about improving school systems and teaching learning approaches to ensure quality education for all learners (Forlin, 2008, 2010; Sharma, 2011). Many educationists (e.g. Ainscow, 2005; Sen 2005; Slee, 2010) opined that the broader objective of inclusive education is to achieve equity and social justice for all citizens in every aspect
of life including education. Researchers and educationists that promote social model of inclusion criticized the opposite paradigm, known as 'medical model of inclusion'. They argue that the medical model tends to judge differing abilities of learners as deviance that need to be treated and handled separately from the mainstream (Loreman, Deppeler, \& Harvey, 2005). Such discrimination points out a child's deficits first rather than identifying their potentials and strengths and less interested in improving teaching-learning approaches to address educational needs of all children's (Ainscow, 1997). This study made an attempt to analyze the secondary documents to explore whether those documents promote social or medical model of inclusion in Bangladesh.

## Ethical Consideration

This study is conducted through secondary data analysis. Therefore, acknowledgements of the secondary data sources were maintained. Data sources were acknowledged by appropriate referencing. In addition, careful paraphrasing was done to avoid plagiarism. Consent was taken if this study required representation of any part of other published materials. Moreover, if there was any issue of maintaining anonymity, special care was given to keep those identities hidden. Lastly, the Child Protection Policy of Plan Bangladesh was maintained in this study.

## Chapter 6

## Findings of the Study

Based on the secondary data analysis in this study following themes emerged:
a) Policy status and strategic directions of the Government on inclusive education
b) Overall situation of children with disabilities
c) Services and educational facilities and approaches available for children with disabilities
d) Existing and potential linkages, coordination between government and other's effort considering the rights of children with disabilities
e) Prominent research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education
f) Challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh

Findings of the study have been distributed under the themes mentioned above and presented in the following paragraphs.

## a) Policy status and strategic directions of the Government on inclusive education

## i. Defining inclusive education and its target group in the context of Bangladesh

Inclusive education is very much context oriented. Therefore, it is important to understand the definition of inclusive education in a country perspective. This is important because the policies and socio-cultural context of a country can contribute in selecting target groups of inclusive education as well as can have variation in service delivery approaches related to inclusive education. UNESCO-Dhaka office organized a consultative workshop in 2001 with different stakeholders for developing a working definition of inclusive education in the context of Bangladesh. The functional definition of inclusive education developed for Bangladesh is as follows:

Inclusive Education is an approach to improve the education system by limiting and removing barriers to learning and acknowledging individual children's needs and potential. The goal of this approach is to make a significant impact on the educational opportunities of those: who attend school but who for different reasons do not achieve adequately and those who are not attending school but who could attend if families, communities, schools and education systems were more responsive to their requirements
(Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006, p. 6).

This is clear from the above mentioned definition of inclusive education that it reflects the values of inclusive education which is also articulated in the UNESCO (2009) definition. However, the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME) through the framework of PEDP II for inclusive education specifically highlighted four theme-areas for the Bangladesh context: gender, children with special needs, ethnic children, and vulnerable groups [e.g. children living in urban slum, street children, refugee children, children from very poor families etc.] (Ahsan \& Mullick, in press). Similar to the PEDP II, the Ministry of Education (MOE) through the Teaching Quality Improvement in Secondary Education Project (TQI-SEP) programme specifically identified the target group of inclusive education in secondary education. They are children who are out of secondary education program, girl children, children from ethnic communities, working children, children who are involved in family income-generating activities and children with special needs (TQI-SEP, 2009).

## ii. Policy Status of Inclusive Education in Bangladesh

The Constitution of the Peoples' Republic of Bangladesh. The Government of Bangladesh passed the constitution in 1972 after getting independence in 1971. This constitution was revised and re-published again in 2000 (Ministry of Law Justice \& Parliamentary Affairs, 2000). The Constitution of Bangladesh plays the most significant role in developing a discrimination-free inclusive society through ensuring equal rights to all basic needs including education. Part II of the constitution described the right to education in the following way:

Article 17- The state shall adopt effective measures for the purpose of establishing a uniform, mass oriented and universal system of education and extending free and compulsory education to all children to such stage as may be determined by law (Ministry of Law Justice \& Parliamentary Affairs, 2000: 5-6).

Moreover, Part III of the Constitution ensured non-discrimination in different sectors including education and recommended to take actions to meet special educational needs of different students:

> Article 28 (3)- No citizen shall, on grounds only of religion, race, caste, sex or place of birth be subjected to any disability, liability, restriction, or condition with regard to access to any place of public entertainment or resort, or admission to any educational institution (Ministry of Law Justice \& Parliamentary Affairs, 2000: 8).

> Article 28 (4)- Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making special provision in favour of women or children or for the advancement of any backward section of citizens (Ministry of Law Justice \& Parliamentary Affairs, $2000: 8)$.

Therefore, this seems to be a constitutional obligation for the Government of Bangladesh to ensure equal social justice to all citizens with a view to establish a barrier-free inclusive society.

The Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990. Bangladesh immediate after having agreement with the UNESCO regarding EFA Declaration in 1990, enacted the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 (MOPME, 1990). This Act declared primary education compulsory and free for all children. The Act also proclaimed that it is the responsibility of the Government to provide Basic education free of cost through the primary education system in Bangladesh. However, it did not validated inclusive education as a strategy to achieve EFA goals (Ahsan \& Mullick, in Press). Conversely, a section of this Act showed a clear limitation against children with disabilities in the following way:
"27.3.3 (e) the decision of a primary education officer that it is not desirable to enter a child in a primary education institute on account of its being mentally retarded" (MOPME, 1990, p. 1).

This clause of the Act raises another crucial argument that whether the primary education officers have the background or training or tools to assess the abilities of a child with intellectual disability.

Bangladesh Persons with Disability Welfare Act-2001. Since participating in the Dakar Conference 2000, the Government enacted the Bangladesh Persons with Disability Welfare Act 2001 (Ministry of Social Welfare [MSW], 2001). This Act was ratified based on the National Disability Welfare Policy developed in 1996. The Act covered rights of persons with disabilities in five development areas: education, health, employment, accessibility, and transportation. Part D of this Act described the right of persons with disabilities into education in the following manner:

- To encourage establishment of Specialized Education Institutions to cater to the special needs of the special categories of children with disabilities, to design and develop specialized curriculum and write special text books and to introduce Special Examination System, if situations so demand.
- Create opportunities for free education to all children with disabilities below 18 years of age and provide them books and equipments free of cost or at low-cost.
- Endeavor to create opportunities for integration of students with disabilities in the usual class-set-up of regular normal schools wherever possible.
- Undertake programmes for imparting vocational training for the disabled.
- Arrange trainings for the teachers and other employees working with the disabled.
- To incorporate/include appropriate articles and other related subjects in the introductory social science subjects aiming to create public awareness about the lifestyle and associated problems faced by the persons with disabilities.
- To arrange easy transport facilities for up-down journey to school for the students with disabilities.
(NFOWD, 2001, p. 11-12)

This act proposed a legal framework for people with disabilities to get access into regular schools. However, it is clearly understood that the first line of the Part D proposed a segregated system of education and the third line proposed for an inclusive education system. What is missing in this Act is to develop collaboration between these two systems to make inclusion happen in reality.

## Comprehensive Early Childhood Care and Development (ECCD) Policy Framework

The Ministry of Women and Children Affairs developed the revised comprehensive Early Childhood Care and Development (ECCD) policy framework in 2012 (MOWCA, 2012). This policy framework promoted the values of inclusive education from the very early stage of a child's life by articulating equal rights in the vision and mission of the policy document in the following way:

## Vision

All children, irrespective of gender, special needs, ethnicity, religion, geographical location and economic status, are nurtured, valued and loved; and have the best start in life for reaching their full potential.

## Mission

- Ensure growth and development of children with special needs so that they can be included in the mainstream without any discrimination.
- Ensure growth and development of children from tribes, minority groups and those who are disadvantaged and at the backward sections of the society so that their quality can be reached at the national standard without showing any discrimination.
(MOWCA, 2012, p.13)
In addition to that the guiding principles of ECCD also repeated the importance of inclusion in every sphere of life of children with special needs as well as children from tribes, minority groups and those who are disadvantaged and at the backward sections of the society (MOWCA, 2012, p.14). The same section also gave importance on gender equity. While defining the concept of special need/disability (p. 6 \& 9), the framework covered all types of disabilities (MOWCA, 2012). In the section where the ECCD framework discussed about the age appropriate activities, it recommended to take special care for children with special needs to identify their disability and provide support services within 3 years of age after birth (MOWCA, 2012, p. 16). Besides, special care was also recommended for children from tribes, minority groups and those who are disadvantaged and at the backward sections of the society. At the age of 6-8 years, the policy recommended that the early screening and identification and intervention services for children with disabilities have to be provided in schools and inclusive education have to be implemented to bring diverse children into education (MOWCA, 2012, p. 17-18). For inclusion of children with disabilities, the ECCD framework recommended that institutions should ensure child-friendly environment, food and nutrition, accessible environment, make assistive and educational materials available, provide vocational self-help occupational skill supports, make support services available and increase organizational involvements as well as participation of family and community members in the programs (MOWCA, 2012, p. 18-19). Moreover, The ECCD policy framework recommended developing cooperation and collaboration among ministries, NGOs, development partners and other institutions for ensuring quality and effective services through suggesting several working committees.


## April 2013

Hence, it is evident that the ECCD policy is very much pro-inclusive. If the ECCD policy approved, it can be expected that children will experience an inclusive environment from the very beginning of their life..

National Plan of Action Phase II. The National Plan of Action Phase II (NPA II) has been designed by the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME) to achieve basic primary education for all children by the year 2015. NPA II is to be implemented between the periods of 2003-2015 (MOPME, 2003). NPA II is a very important and pro-inclusive policy document for primary education in Bangladesh. One example of its proinclusiveness is that Vision 5.2.iii articulates:
"All primary school-age children (6-10 years), boys and girls, including all ethnic groups, disadvantaged and disabled, are enrolled and successfully completing the primary cycle and achieving quality education" (MOPME, 2003, p. 28).

As an outcome of the NPA II, the Directorate of Primary Education (DPE) designed large scale program such as the Second Primary Education Development Program (PEDP II) for ensuring education for all. Inclusive education has been accepted in the PEDP II as a strategy to achieve these goals.

## National Education Policy 2010

Recently developed the National Education Policy 2010 in Bangladesh reflected the values of inclusion of diverse children in the mainstream education system through the following goals and objectives:
\#07: Eliminate discriminations on grounds of nationality, religion, class and gender; build up an environment that promotes secularism, global-brotherhood, and empathy towards humanity and respect towards human rights
\#22: Bringing all socio-economically disadvantaged children into education including street-children
\#23: Ensuring the scopes of development of cultural and linguistic characteristics of all the indigenous and ethnic groups in Bangladesh
\#24: Ensuring the rights of all children with disabilities
(Ministry of Education [MOE], 2010, p. 1-2).
In addition, different sections of the policy suggested several reform initiatives to promote inclusive education. The following Table (Table 1) provides information in the education policy that supports the values of inclusive education:
Table 1 : Inclusive education related information in the National Education Policy 2010
related information in the National Education Policy 2010

[^1]Page No
Source: MOE, 2010
Table 1 : Inclusive education related information in the National Education Policy 2010 (Cont.)

| Chapter Title | Page No. Features related to Inclusive Education |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Secondary <br> Education | 12 | Goals and Objectives of Secondary Education 04: Putting efforts for minimizing disparity in different secondary level institutions and in different groups who are staying behind due to socioeconomic and ethnic reasons. |
| Adult and Nonformal Education | 11 | Bringing disadvantaged children into this approach of education from the under-developed areas of Bangladesh. |
| Vocational and Technical Education | 16 | Strategy 10: Providing special emphasis on including children with disabilities in the vocational and technical education. |
| Higher Education | 24 | Strategy 18: ...universities cannot be discriminatory on the grounds of nationality, religion, race, socio-economic status and for any physical handicaps. |
| Fine Arts and Aesthetic Education | 41 | Strategy 2: Providing special support to all ethnic minorities and disadvantaged groups. |
| Special Education, Health and Physical Education, Scout, Girl guide and Aesthetic Education | 42-43 | Goals and Objectives of Special Education: <br> - Special education objective 1: Preparing children with disabilities for including them in the mainstream education system. <br> Strategies: <br> - Strategy 2: Shifting special education system from the Ministry of Social Welfare to the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education. <br> - Strategy 13: People with disabilities should get equal opportunity in job market. Besides, they should get some special facilities in the job market. |
| Teacher Training | 56 | Goals and Objectives of Teacher Training: <br> - Goals and Objectives 09: Providing equal opportunity for all learners through teaching learning irrespective of religion, race, nationality, and socio-economic condition. <br> - Goals and Objectives 10: Introducing strategies to teach children from ethnic minority groups and children with disabilities according to their learning-needs. |

## National Child Policy 2011

Recently, government has approved the National Child Policy 2011 (Ministry of Women and Children Affairs [MOWCA], 2011). The Child policy articulated different clauses in support of gender equity. This child policy provided special emphasis on rights of children with special needs and children with autism in the following way:
"6.8.2 Initiatives will be taken to ensure inclusion of children with disabilities in the mainstream society including participation in education" (MOWCA, 2011, p. 10).

The same section proposed segregated education for some children with special needs (MOWCA, 2011, p. 10). Similar to the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 (MOE, 1990), this National Child Policy 2011 declared that children with disabilities who would not be able to participate in the regular education for some "unavoidable reasons" would be provided special education (MOWCA, 2011, p. 10).

## Pre-Primary Education Curriculum

National Curriculum and Text Book Board (NCTB) recently developed the pre-primary education curriculum in Bangladesh (NCTB, 2011). Inclusiveness is one of the principles of preprimary curriculum to make it diversity friendly (NCTB, 2011, p. 9). It has been accepted around the world that early identification (even after birth) and early intervention (even at the six months of age) are the key to sound development for a child with disability. Thus, pre-primary education is given high priority for ensuring early intervention for children with disabilities. Though the curriculum claims that it promotes inclusiveness, the aims and objectives of the curriculum did not mention anything about early identification and intervention of the needs of diverse children. The curriculum promoted Vygotsky's social constructivist teaching learning approaches to be followed in the preprimary education, which can be identified as strength if implemented adequately. The curriculum identified several key areas of development for children such as: physical and locomotion, sensory, social, emotional, ethical, language and communication, numeracy, creativity, environmental, science and technological and health and safety related development. Based on these key areas different age appropriate activities, learning outcomes and educational materials were recommended. But educational and learning needs of different children with disabilities were not mentioned here. Moreover, the curriculum did not provide any scope of flexible alternative teaching-learning and assessment procedures to make education child-friendly but a guideline is there to do all the inclusive related job by involving experts in this field which is appreciable. Besides, no early identification and intervention technique is present in the curriculum. However, the curriculum also recommended to develop a Teacher training guidebook and workbook through which the limitations can be overcome.

## April 2013

## Draft Persons with Disabilities Rights Act 2011

In response to recent UNCRPD (UN Enable, 2008), Bangladesh enacted the Draft Persons with Disabilities Rights Act 2011 (Ministry of Social Welfare [MSW], 2011). While defining the rights of persons with disabilities, Section 5.8 of the act declared that it is an equal right of all citizens having disabilities to be enrolled and getting educational opportunities in every sphere of the education system in Bangladesh. While defining what is meant to be discrimination, section 22 (a) of the draft act clearly declared that any school refusing to enroll a person with special needs due to his/her disability will be considered as a discrimination and subject to be considered for serious punishable offence by the law. The act also mentioned about ensuring support by the government for implementing inclusive education. If this act is enacted by the parliament, it would contribute to ensure rights of persons with disabilities into education.

## iii. Initiatives at Primary Education Level

Several initiatives at primary level are promoting the philosophy of inclusive education. Among those initiatives PEDP II is the largest education sector-wide approach (SWA) in Bangladesh. The following paragraphs describe in brief the initiatives taken at primary level to promote inclusive education in Bangladesh.

Second Primary Education Development Program-PEDP II. The broad aim of the PEDP II program was to offer quality and accessible primary education to all children (DPE, 2007). Inclusive education was accepted by this program as a strategy to achieve EFA. As mentioned previously that the framework of inclusive education in PEDP II covered four target groups: children with special needs, ethnic children, gender, and vulnerable groups (e.g. slum children, refugee children, street children, orphans, children from ultra poor families etc.). Action plans for inclusive education in four target areas were designed to implement the values of inclusive education in three levels:
i. central level that covered ministry and directorate level;
ii. district level such as mid level primary education administrators and iii. school-level.

The following table (Table 2) provides the inclusive education related activities at the primary education level.
Table 2: Inclusive education action plans of the PEDP II

| Target Groups | Central level | Activities District Level | School Level |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Tribal Children | - Awareness raising and improving knowledge about the cultural diversity and needs of tribal children in DPE and MOPME <br> - Create posts in the DPE to take responsibility for tribal children's education <br> - Make information available regarding tribal for decision making <br> - Provide stipend support for tribal students <br> - Orienting NCTB staff to understand and be sensitive to tribal children issues <br> - Train up the PTI instructors and revise the C-in-Ed curriculum to reflect issues related to tribal children | - Increasing capacity building activities of education officials regarding education of tribal children's <br> - Support NGO schools where national curriculum is followed <br> - Teachers with experience of teaching tribal children to become key resource persons for sharing knowledge and assist other teachers in cluster <br> - Construction of new schools in Hills, Tea garden and Haor areas (wet-lands), where required. | - Awareness raising for SMCs on tribal children's education and recruiting members from tribal community at SMC <br> - Active participation of tribal parents and members of community in SMC and PTA <br> - Appointment of Community teachers in tribal area school <br> - Provide training, support and incentives for teachers to work with tribal children <br> - Organize in-service training for Head teachers on tribal issues and revise training materials <br> - Enhance community participation and awareness on tribal children's education <br> - Allow the use of local language, supplementary materials and locally sourced resources in classroom <br> - Develop flexible policies for schools to allow changes in school calendar and timing according to local needs |
| Children with Special Needs | - Awareness raising about the diversity and needs of children with special needs in DPE and MOPME <br> - Train up PTI instructors on special needs education and the philosophy of Education for All <br> - Train up NCTB officials (Primary curriculum wing) and NAPE staff s regarding special needs issues <br> - Establish inter and intra ministerial coordination and within their departments for systematic interaction for promotion of education of children with special needs | - Awareness-raising at all levels in the society - both in and out of the system to eliminate the stigma related to special needs <br> - Train up district education personnel on special needs and inclusive education issues <br> - Capacity building of education officials to support teachers in schools | - Create provision of assistive and educational devices free or at a reasonable cost for special children <br> - Comprise all children with special needs in stipend program <br> - Offer SLIPs training to address special needs issues <br> - Train up all head teacher to address special needs issues. <br> - Teachers with experience in particular special needs children are to become key resource persons for sharing knowledge and assisting other teachers <br> - Ensure accessible environment (including classrooms and toilet facilities) by making ramps for children with physical impairment as far as possible <br> - Awareness raising for SMCs on special needs |


| Target Groups | Central level | Activities District Level | School Level |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Vulnerable Children | - Awareness raising in DPE and MOPME regarding Vulnerable Children's education and their current situation <br> - Inter-ministerial collaboration and coordination <br> - Review the government's Stipend Programme and criteria to ensure access to the maximum number of poor children <br> - Awareness raising and capacity building for PTI and C -in-Ed curriculum to reflect issues related to vulnerable children's education. <br> - Increase knowledge and understanding of NCTB staff regarding vulnerable children's education. | Embrace issues related to vulnerable children's education in the training curricula for education officials <br> Assign one person from existing officers of each district with understanding of vulnerable children's education issues to support initiatives for greater inclusion at local level. <br> Establish new schools in areas where there are currently insufficient or no facilities. <br> Prepare flexible policy for the poorest and disaster affected children to enable them to attend school including pilot programmes in disaster prone areas Support resource centre instructors to assist teachers to transfer training into practice. <br> Assess needs and mobilise local resources and arrange boats to bring children and teachers from their house to schools at wet-lands (haor) and islands (char) areas during monsoons and flood periods. | - Increase community participation \& awareness towards supporting primary and Vulnerable Children's Education. <br> - Empowering SMC and PTA in strengthening Vulnerable Children's Education. <br> - Provide appropriate training and support for teachers to work with vulnerable children's groups <br> - Facilitate teachers to become resource persons in their cluster to advise and support each other <br> - Embrace issues related to Vulnerable Children's Education in the training curriculum for teachers and head teacher in-service training. <br> - Awareness raising and capacity building of SMCs and PTAs. |



PEDP II (DPE, 2007) claimed that all teachers as well as SMC members in 438 Upzilas received training on inclusive education. Despite running a notable number of initiatives in relation to inclusive education, some strategies of the action plan have created a clear discrimination for a specific group of children. For example, the following paragraph from the action plan for children with special needs in PEDP II took discriminatory actions against children with severe disabilities:

> The issues associated with the inclusion of students with mild/moderate disabilities - the largest group of students with disabilities - differ significantly from those associated with the very small minority of students who have more severe disabilities. Mild/moderate disabilities include learning disabilities, emotional disturbance, and cognitive impairment. Students with mild/moderate disabilities present unique curricular and instructional challenges because access to and achievement in the general education curriculum is the primary goal of their inclusion. (DPE, 2005, p. 8)

The issue of concern regarding such discrimination is that the definition used to determine children with mild to moderate disabilities is inappropriate. Children with hearing/visual/ physical/multiple and intellectual disabilities all have slight to severe/profound degree of disability. Even the Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act 2001 legally accepted such classifications. Moreover, it has to be understood that children with severe or profound hearing/physical/visual/multiple impairments have very sound records of having excellent academic and social development even in the context of Bangladesh. Several Bangladeshi successful cases (ACIE, 2012; CSID, 2002; IER, 2010; personal communication) of academic and social inclusion regarding people who have severe to profound disability could be some examples to make strong arguments for changing such discriminatory policies. Impact of such discriminatory policies is visible in the Primary School Census 2010 of DPE (2011) and in Bangladesh Primary Education Annual Sector Performance Report 2012 (DPE, 2012), which stated that participation of children with disabilities into primary education is increasing. But still many children with disabilities are left out of education. Details of those reports have been presented later on in this study.

Other initiatives in Primary Education with Similar Goals. Review of documents indicated that several other educational initiatives have the aim to ensure equity in primary education for all children. Examples of such two initiatives are Upazila Primary Education Plan (UPEP) and the School Level Improvement Plan (SLIP). UPEP promoted decentralized management of schools to improve school-administration in countryside of Bangladesh (UNICEF, 2009). On the other hand, the objective of the SLIP project was to enhance community involvement in school activities and empower members of the community to take policy decisions at school level. SLIP provided scope to members of School Management Committee (SMC), parents, teachers, and community members to work together for improving the learning for all children (DPE, 2009). SLIP prohibited discrimination due to gender, special needs, ethnicity, and socio-economic background.

Another initiative titled Primary Education Stipend project aimed to support more than 5 million disadvantaged students. The PES initiative was designed to provide $100 \%$ financial support to primary school-age students living in rural Bangladesh. The PES aimed to increase enrolment and attendance of poor disadvantaged children and decrease the drop-out rate of those children (MOPME, 2010). This initiative will be completed in 2013. Students have to maintain pass marks and $85 \%$ attendance to receive the stipend on a regular basis. With a similar goal of PES, an initiative titled Reaching Out-of-School Children (ROSC) has been designed to identify and include children into education programs who are not yet brought in schools under the PEDP II program or dropped out from schools for more than a year ago (Uniconsult International Limited [UCIL], 2011). ROSC covered 60 sub-districts in 34 districts of Bangladesh and will continue until 2013.

PEDP IIII. As the continuation of the Primary Education Development Programme Phase I and II, the Third Primary Education Development Programme (PEDP III) is a five-year, sector-wide program covering Grades I to V and one year of pre-primary education (DPE, 2011). The aim of PEDP III is to establish an efficient, inclusive, and equitable primary education system delivering effective and relevant child-friendly learning to all Bangladesh's children from pre-primary through Grade V primary. The total budget of the PEDP III is USD 8.3 billion (DPE, 2011). PEDP III has six results areas: learning outcomes, participation, reducing disparities, decentralization, effective use of budget allocations, and programme planning and management. The third result area "reducing disparities" directly promote initiatives that support inclusive education (DPE, 2011). PEDP III is a strong program document for implementing inclusive education as the document DPE (2011) describes the target groups of inclusive education in the following manner:
"Sub-Component 2.1.3 Mainstreaming Inclusive Education (IE): The sub-component addresses the particular needs in formal schools of tribal children, ethnic minorities, children with learning disabilities, and disabled children. The intention is to create an inclusive culture based on the principle that all learners have a right to education irrespective of their individual characteristics or differences" (DPE, 2011, p. 7).
"Inclusive Primary Education: This will enable all primary school-age children to complete good quality primary education. The access portion will focus on reaching the unreached, particularly disabled, working children, children in difficult circumstances, and children belonging to ethnic minorities or living in remote areas. Tribal children are encouraged to learn in their mother tongue" (DPE, 2011, p. 46).

It has also been noticed from the PEDP III main document of DPE (2011) that a variety of initiatives that include curriculum reform, teacher-training, training of educational administrators, infrastructural reform and more are to be done to promote inclusive education under the banner of this program. However, still, the segregation as well as confusing concept in relation to degrees and types of disabilities is present in this program document, as one section of the implementation guide of the PEDP III describes:
"Inclusive refers to groups of children underrepresented in schools such as: children with mild to moderate physical or learning disabilities, ethnic minorities, urban street children, tribal children, extremely poor children" (DPE, 2011a, p. 9).

This section of the implementation guide raise a vital question whether children with other types and degrees of disabilities do not have equal right to be included in the preprimary or primary education program in Bangladesh, and why not? PEDP III developed a Gender and Inclusive Education Action Plan (DPE, 2011c) to implement inclusive education. It has been observed from the review of the document that many areas related to inclusive education and special needs issues are yet to be addressed in this plan. Appendix 2 provides specific recommendation on different components of the Gender and Inclusive Education Action Plan.

## iv. Initiatives at Secondary Education Level

Successful initiatives of the Government of Bangladesh at the secondary level such as the Female Secondary School Stipend Project (FSP) and Teaching Quality Improvement in Secondary Education Project (TQI-SEP) have made examples for other countries to promote inclusive education. FSP was run by the Ministry of Education since 1982 (Raynor\& Wesson, 2006) and offered tuition-fees as well as monthly stipends for unmarried rural female students to complete their education until Grade X. In recent times, stipend project has been extended up to grade XII (DSHE, 2011) and included female students at undergraduate level as well (DSHE, 2010). To be eligible, female students have to be unmarried, attain at least $75 \%$ attendance and minimum $45 \%$ marks in the exams. This project significantly increased participation of female students and dropped early marriage rate (DSHE, 2011; Raynor \& Wesson, 2006; Schurmann, 2009). FSP is considered as a successful model for ensuring gender equity in education.

Teaching Quality Improvement in Secondary Education Project (TQI-SEP) targeted to ensure the quality of secondary education in four areas: Improving teacher quality through organizational development and capacity building, improving teacher training facilities, strengthening in-service and pre-service teacher training and increasing equitable access and improving community involvement (TQI-SEP, 2010). Inclusive education is one of the goals of this project. For promoting the values of inclusive education this project revised the pre-service teacher training (B.Ed.) curriculum, School Management Committee (SMC) members, teacher trainers and head teachers received training on inclusive education (TQI-SEP, 2006; 2008; 2009; 2010). Moreover, continuous professional development (CPD) was offered for classroom teachers. As a result of such initiatives at secondary level, participation of children who are out of secondary education, girl children, children from ethnic communities, working children, children who are involved in family income-generating activities and children with special needs were increased.

## a) Overall situation of children with disabilities

## Prevalence of disability

Very few studies have been conducted in Bangladesh to reveal the overall situation of children with disabilities in Bangladesh. However, those studies do not provide the accurate number of persons with disabilities in Bangladesh. According to DPE (2005) disability issue is not included in the routine data collection or surveillance system of the health sector of the government. However, it was included in the national census conducted in 1982, 1986 and 1991. Since the identification or screening of disability issue require adequate training and experience, those initiatives for the census could not ensure such resources to collect data about citizen with disabilities. As a result, the census reflected very unreliable figure related to people with disabilities in Bangladesh (DPE, 2005). For example, a survey conducted by the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics on prevalence of disability in 1994 showed only $1.62 \%$ of the total population has disability. This fact is significantly lower than the generally accepted international estimates regarding disability population. World Bank (WB) interpreted the reason behind such unreliable data as inappropriate design of questionnaire, inadequate training and lack of awareness among families regarding the presence of disability among their family members. According to WHO, $10 \%$ of any given population have some sort of disability (WB, 2004). However, WHO further claimed that the percentages of disability among people have increased dramatically in last 35 years and estimated that the current percentage of people with disability is $15 \%$ of any given population (WHO, 2012). A comparatively acceptable finding was presented by a series of baseline surveys conducted first in four, and then in five, locations covering 46,874 and 94,260 people respectively by ActionAID Bangladesh (AAB) between the time period of 1995-97. These surveys reported that overall prevalence rates of disability were $14.4 \%$ and $13.34 \%$ (DPE, 2005).

## Types of Disability

Some studies focused on exploration of types of disabilities exist in the survey participants in different locations of Bangladesh. Three AAB baseline studies conducted in 10 locations reported the following types and percentages of disabilities in the study population:

|  | Baseline Surveys by AAB |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Types of Disability | Four locations | Five locations | Micro Study |  |
| Locomotor | 4.9 | 4.2 | 11.9 |  |
| Visual | 53.5 | 48.8 | 34.2 |  |
| Hearing and Speech | 24.5 | 25.4 | 35.0 |  |
| Cognitive/Intellectual disability | 3.8 | 3.7 | 4.6 |  |
| Epilepsy/other | 2.3 | 2.2 | 2.0 |  |
| Multiple | 11.0 | 15.7 | 12.2 |  |

Table 3: Types of Disabilities Source: (World Bank, 2004, p. 14)

A study was conducted by the ESTEEM project of the Directorate of Primary Education (DPE) and Centre for Services and Information on Disability (CSID) in 2002 under the supervision of Cambridge Education Consortium, UK to explore the education status of children with disabilities in Bangladesh. This study was conducted in 12 districts and in six divisions of Bangladesh. Data was collected from 360 children with disabilities. Findings of the study reported that among the participants the majority ( $50 \%$ ) had physical disability and followed by speech and hearing ( $16 \%$ ), intellectual ( $13 \%$ ), visual ( $9 \%$ ), multiple ( $9 \%$ ) and other ( $3 \%$ ) developmental disabilities. Another study conducted by Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) in 2002 on 2,559,222 children with disabilities aged between 3-10 years. This study reported that among different types of disabilities, physical disabilities showed the highest reported incidence (41.5\%) followed by visual impairments (19.7\%), speech and hearing (19.6\%), intellectual disabilities (7.4 $\%$ ), cerebral palsy ( $7 \%$ ), multiple disabilities ( $3.4 \%$ ) and mental illness ( $1.4 \%$ ) respectively.

Recent Primary School Census 2010 of DPE (2011b) identified 83023 children having disabilities (in which 35994 were girls) and types of children with disabilities enrolled in primary education explored as having poor eyesight (12455), short of hearing (5541), Intellectual/mental (19683), problem in speech (18927) and physical handicap (26417).

## Overall socio-economic situation

Overall situation of people with disabilities in Bangladesh is not impressive yet. Several studies (CSID, 1999, 1999a; CSID, 2002; 2002a; DPE \& CSID, 2002; USAID, 2005) conducted in Bangladesh reported that people with disabilities suffer various social challenges to attain their rights in everyday life. A study conducted by CSID (1999) on street children with disabilities in Dhaka city reported that $63.33 \%$ of street children with disabilities were left out of education. These children frequently face negative attitudes, physical/emotional/sexual abuse at home and outside.

Another study conducted on situation of women with disabilities in Bangladesh (CSID, 2002) based on data collected from 310 girls and women with disabilities reported that women are considered to have 'double-deprivation' in Bangladesh. One is due to having disability and the other one is for experiencing discriminatory and negative attitude due to being women in the social context of Bangladesh. The most alarming finding was found in relation to abuse. The prevalence of abuse of the women and girls with disabilities was $92 \%$ for both groups. All most the equal percentage of women ( $78 \%$ ) and girls ( $75 \%$ ) with disabilities reported emotional abuse. Incidents of physical abuse were same ( $82 \%$ ) for both groups. Besides, cases of sexual abuses ( $32 \%$ and $37 \%$ ) were also almost same for both groups. This study further reported that $64 \%$ (girls and women with disabilities combined) girls dropped out during transition from primary to secondary level. $36.06 \%$ of the women with disabilities and $36.58 \%$ of the girls with disabilities were either verbally abused or their surrounding environment was not in favour of welcoming them in education.

In relation to employment situation of people with disabilities, a study conducted by CSID (2002a) with 452 respondents having disabilities reported that they were very lowpaid, $24 \%$ numbers of respondents were earning less than Taka five hundred per month. $68 \%$ of the employed people with disabilities did not have any savings at the end of a month. $53 \%$ of the employed respondents reported that their current employment was not related to their previous education. Moreover, $39 \%$ of the respondents reported that they faced lack of cooperation, negative attitude, lack of accessibility and adaptability, lack of initiatives in the further development of skills, lack of awareness of employers in realizing the difficulties.

## Education situation

Persons with disabilities in Bangladesh faced the most difficulty in accessing to regular education. A milestone study was conducted by the DPE and CSID in 2002 to explore the educational situation of children with disabilities in Bangladesh. Data were collected from 12 districts of 6 geographical divisions in Bangladesh. This study reported that only $11 \%$ of the respondents received access to some sorts of education in Bangladesh. Therefore, the majority were left out of any type of education. Among the children who were enrolled in education, children with physical disabilities were the most (55\%), followed by the children with hearing and speech disabilities at $15 \%$. The children with visual and intellectual disabilities had enrollment rate of $13 \%$ and $10 \%$ respectively. Children with disabilities who were enrolled into education, faced problems, including negative attitude of peers and teachers. A majority ( $73 \%$ ) of children with disabilities faced problems in enrolling into educational institutes. As the government supported integrated schools are residential, the scope for enrollment is limited, which was even worse for girls than boys (DPE \& CSID, 2002).

Since the ESTEEM Study was conducted in 2002, ten years have been passed. The Government of Bangladesh has revised and enacted several policy documents in favour of education of children with disabilities and implemented several educational programs to promote inclusive education. However, as a result of confusing positions against children with severe or profound disabilities, enrollment opportunity of those children into primary schools is still a challenge . The Primary School Census 2010 of DPE (2011b) also reported that only children with mild disabilities were enrolled in the primary schools totaled 83,023 of which 47,029 were boys and 35,994 were girls. This census claimed slight increase of the enrollment of children with mild disabilities since it was found in the Baseline Survey in 2009, in which the total was 45,680 (DPE, 2011b). Despite such claim of increase, still the enrollment of children with disabilities in primary education is very low $(0.97 \%$ of total student population) considering the total number of children 85 , 63,133 enrolled in primary education (DPE, 2011b).

Recent Bangladesh Primary Education Annual Sector Performance Report 2012 (DPE, 2012) of the Government of Bangladesh claimed that five types of children with disabilities (physical, visual, hearing, speaking and intellectual) have been enrolled into education and their enrollment rate was increased by $5 \%$ per year compared to the baseline level in 2005. The following figure (Figure 1) provides the information of the enrollment rate of children with disabilities into primary education.

Figure 1: Increase of the number of enrolled children with disabilities in 2005, 2010 \& 2011 (DPE, 2012, p. 55)


However, the same report claimed by quoting from the final conclusion report of the PEDP II that the enrollment rate of children with disabilities is not satisfactory for the following reason:
"due to the lack of institutional experience and capacity, opportunities for special needs, tribal and vulnerable children have not been created to the expected level" (DPE, 2012, p. 55)

## Geographical taxonomy

There are very few studies conducted in Bangladesh that focused on geographical taxonomy of people with disabilities. Most studies were conducted following the purposive sampling procedure. However, one study conducted by Unnyan Onneshan in 2005 that was conducted in Barisal (Barisal Sadar, Pirojpur, Patuakhali); Chittagong (Chittagong Sadar, Rangamati, Brahmanbaria); Sylhet (Sylhet Sadar, Moulavibazar, Hobiganj); Dhaka (Dhaka City, Faridpur, Tangail); Khulna (Khulna, Kustia, Bagerhat) and in Rajshahi (Rajshahi, Rangpur, Sirajgonj). This study found that in terms of disability prevalence in different administrative divisions in Bangladesh, Dhaka, Barishal and Rajshahi divisions have higher percentages of people with disabilities compared to others three divisions. In Dhaka division the rate is $8.2 \%$ and in Barisal $6.4 \%$ followed by Rajshahi division ( $6 \%$ ). In Khulna, Sylhet and Chittagong these rates are found as $4.3 \%$, $4.3 \%$ and $4.2 \%$ respectively.

Another source of geographical taxonomy of children with disabilities who are enrolled in education can be found in the recent DPE (2012) report. This report referred the Child Education and Literacy Survey (CELS) 2010 published in 2012 which mentioned that, 118,575 children with special needs of age 3-14 years were enrolled in different schools. Among them $58.4 \%$ were boys \& $60.8 \%$ were girls. The rate for rural children ( $60.7 \%$ ) was higher than urban children ( $54.3 \%$ ). Among the seven divisions, Rajshahi had the highest proportion enrolled (63.4\%) and Sylhet the lowest (51.9\%).

As there is absence of a national census or empirical study-based geographical taxonomy for children with disabilities in Bangladesh, future research planners on inclusive education at primary level in Bangladesh have to follow a purposive sampling procedure to reveal reliable source of samples for their studies. A guideline of such purposive sampling procedures have been recommended by the researcher of this study in the 'Recommendation and Conclusion' Chapter (Chapter 8).
c) Services and educational facilities and approaches available for children with
disabilities disabilities
Some studies have looked at the services and educational facilities and approaches available for children with disabilities in Bangladesh. The following section provides information related to educational facilities and approaches available for children with disabilities in Bangladesh.

## Existing Educational Facilities and approaches for Children with disabilities

Several documents such as CSID $(2002,2005)$ studies on education situation of children with disabilities in Bangladesh, PEDP II Action Plan for children with disabilities (DPE, 2005), Ahuja and Ibrahim (2006)'s report for UNESCO related to inclusive education situation in Bangladesh, UNICEF (2003) report on inclusive education in Bangladesh and Ahsan (2007)'s article on education of children with special needs published in a national peer-reviewed journal were the sources of information to explore existing facilities and educational approaches available for children with disabilities in Bangladesh. Summary of the findings from the review of those documents indicate that there are three types of educational approaches provided by the Government and NGOs in Bangladesh:
I. Inclusive School-access to regular primary schools for all children.
II. Integrated School-a special unit in a regular school compound with resource room and resource teacher support.
III. Special School-segregated educational settings with special curriculum, teaching aids and special teachers.

## I. Inclusive School.

Government Initiatives. Under the PEDP II program, all the head teachers were oriented on inclusive education using a generic module. Besides, the Government of Bangladesh also sent a office order to all government primary schools to include children with diverse backgrounds including disabilities into regular school programs. Therefore, all government primary schools must have officially and theoretically have become inclusive schools. Besides, PEDP III is also committed to continue inclusive education program and allocated budget for that but non government primary schools were not brought into this program by the government yet.

Innovation Grant-A Government initiative to develop GO-NGO Collaboration: PEDP II designed a project to initiate the GO-NGO collaboration for promoting inclusive education named Innovation Grant with a focus to reach those children who were excluded from the regular schools. Innovation grants supported organizations that works for enhancing the role of the school and community in meeting the needs of children with disabilities, (DPE, 2006). This grant promoted collaboration among schools, communities, government and civil society organizations (Nasreen \& Tate, 2007).

Non Government Initiatives. Several non-government organizations run inclusive schools in Bangladesh. For example, The Centre for Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed (CRP)'s inclusive school enrolls children with disabilities into their regular classrooms. Bangladesh Protibondhi Foundation (BPF) is running "Inclusive Education" program in several schools under their Community Based Rehabilitation (CBR) project areas in Dhaka. Moreover, BRAC, since 2003, started inclusive education program in their primary schools. According to Mahbub (2008) BRAC enrolled 57,645 ethnic children and 28,144 children with disability in their schools. In addition, Underprivileged Children's Education Programme (UCEP) has inclusive schools in urban areas for very poor, working children and children with disabilities. Besides, AID, NRAS, Gram Bangla Unnyan Committee (GBUC), SARPV and YPSA are some other NGOs that run inclusive school. However, no empirical data is available so far to recognise the models of inclusive education that are practiced by these organizations. Among International organizations Plan Bangladesh, Save the Children, ADD, AusAID, UKAID, DFID, UDA European Union and UN bodies are supporting inclusive education movements in Bangladesh. Review of findings indicates that there is no data yet regarding the standard or diversity of inclusive school in Bangladesh.

## II. Integrated School

DSS has 64 integrated schools alongside government regular schools in 64 district towns of the country. This project provides a Resource Teacher in every school and a resource room for students with visual impairment in the regular school compound. These schools receive Braille books free of cost for all children with visual impairment.

## III. Special school

Government Special School: The Department of Social Services (DSS), under the Ministry of Social Welfare have 7 special schools for children with hearing impairment situated in Dhaka, Chittagong, Rajshahi, Khulna, Chandpur, Faridpur and Sylhet. These schools enrolls 700 children and have residential facilities for about 180 children.

In addition, DSS also runs a special school for children with intellectual disabilities and runs 5 residential special schools for children with visual impairment, in Dhaka, Chittagong, Rajshahi, and Khulna. Those schools have the enrollment capacity for 500 children. The schools provide food and hostel facilities for 180 children with visual impairment. Moreover, DSS, in 1991, built a National Centre for Special Education (NCSE) situated in Mirpur Dhaka, offers residential special school for 190 children having hearing, visual, intellectual disabilities and autism.

Non-government Special Schools: There are several special schools for children with hearing impairment. Bangladesh National Federation for the Deaf has a school based on sign language situated at Bijoynagar, Dhaka. There are about 1400 students with hearing impairment in the school. Another NGO, named Hi-Care has 10 special schools in different parts of the country including one in Dhaka city for children with hearing impairment aged between 3 to 16 years. Another organization named The Society for Assistance to Hearing Impaired Children (SAHIC) has set up a National Centre for Hearing and Speech in Dhaka. The centre has 140 children between the age-range of 3 to 5 years. In addition, the Deaf Children's Welfare Association of Bangladesh was established in 1998 and has 46 students.

For children with visual impairment, the Baptist Sangha School runs a residential school for girls situated in Mirpur, Dhaka. There are about 138 girls currently enrolled in this school. Besides, Bangladesh Dristhihin Foundation (BDF) runs education and rehabilitation projects in Bhola district and is continuing this process in Narayanganj, Munshigonj, Comilla and Rajbari.

The Society for the Welfare of the Intellectually Disabled-Bangladesh, established in 1977, has about 40 schools all over Bangladesh. A total of 6,552 children with intellectual disabilities are enrolled in those schools. Besides, The Bangladesh Protibondhi Foundation (BPF) runs special schools for children with intellectual disabilities, cerebral palsy and those who have autism in Dhaka. Other NGOs who focus on autism and children having intellectual disability and cerebral palsy are Autism Welfare Centre, Society for the Welfare of the Autistic Children, Caring Glory, and School for the Gifted etc.

| Type of Disability | Geographical location | Name of Organization | Number of schools |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Hearing impairment | Dhaka | Bangladesh National Federation for the Deaf has a school | 01 |
|  | In all Divisions | Hi-Care | 10 |
|  | Dhaka | The Society for Assistance to Hearing Impaired Children (SAHIC) | 01 |
|  | Dhaka | The Deaf Children's Welfare Association of Bangladesh | 01 |
| Visual Impairment | Dhaka | Baptist Sangha School | 01 |
|  | Bhola, <br> Narayanganj, <br> Munshigonj, <br> Comilla and <br> Rajbari | Bangladesh Dristhihin Foundation (BDF | -- |
| Intellectual disability and Autism | In all Divisions | The Society for the Welfare of the Intellectually Disabled-Bangladesh | 40 |
|  | Dhaka | The Bangladesh Protibondhi Foundation (BPF) | 03 |
|  | Dhaka | Autism Welfare Centre | 01 |
|  | Dhaka | Society for the Welfare of the Autistic Children | 01 |
|  | Dhaka | School for the Gifted | 01 |
|  | Dhaka | Caring Glory | 01 |

From the above table it can be clearly understood that the published documents did not documented schools for children with disability according to geographical locations. Hence, it is a requirement to identify those schools for future planning to implement inclusive education.

## April 2013

Other Services available for children with disabilities regarding inclusive education
$\left.\begin{array}{|llll|}\hline \begin{array}{l}\text { Name of the } \\ \text { Institution }\end{array} & \text { Services Provided } & \begin{array}{l}\text { Geographical } \\ \text { location }\end{array} \\ \hline \begin{array}{ll}\text { IER, Univer- } \\ \text { sity of Dhaka }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { Institute of Education and Research (IER) at the } \\ \text { University of Dhaka has established the Depart- } \\ \text { ment of Special Education since 1993. This } \\ \text { department offers teacher education programs on } \\ \text { special education at undergraduate (B.Ed-Hons.) } \\ \text { and postgraduate (M.Ed., M.Phil, PhD) levels. } \\ \text { Besides, IER also offers training on Inclusive } \\ \text { education for teachers, NGO workers and to any } \\ \text { other interested stakeholders. Recently, IER } \\ \text { worked with the MOE under the TQI-SEP }\end{array} & \\ \hline & \begin{array}{l}\text { program for providing training on inclusive } \\ \text { education for teacher educators. Besides, IER } \\ \text { also offered training for Master-trainer develop- }\end{array} \\ \text { ment on inclusive education for BEP of BRAC. }\end{array}\right]$

| Name of the Institution | Services Provided | Geographical location |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Inclusion Initiatives for Special-needs Bangladesh (IISB) | Another NGO named Inclusion Initiatives for Special-needs Bangladesh (IISB), Dhaka provides short training on inclusive education, conducts research and awareness raising programs regarding inclusive education. IISB also publishes different documents to promote the concept of inclusive education in Bangladesh. This NGO has a national standard Newsletter titled "Inclusion Newsletter: Bangladesh" and an international journal titled "Asian Journal of Inclusive Education (AJIE)" having ISSN for both documents. Besides, this NGO also provides stipend support for children with disabilities who are in inclusive schools. IISB offers homesupport for children with severe intellectual disabilities and those who have ADHD or autism and also offers variety of supports to make any school inclusive. | Dhaka |
| Centre for Services for Information on Disability (CSID) | An NGO named Centre for Services for Information on Disability (CSID) conducts research, disseminates information on disability. | Dhaka |
| Teacher Development Institute (TDI) | Teacher Development Institute (TDI) is another non-government platform that provides training on special education and inclusive education. | Dhaka |

In addition to different services mentioned above, the following paragraphs describe in brief about activities of two more NGOs named Centre for Disability in Development (CDD) and Sightsavers Bangladesh as they have wide range of activities on inclusive education with the government and other NGOs.

## Centre for Disability in Development (CDD)

Centre for Disability in Development was established in 1996. CDD provides training, advocacy, network development, monitoring and evaluation of activities related to people with disabilities. CDD offers training for the staff of government agencies, NGOs, community-based rehabilitation workers, teachers, and people with disabilities to design programmes focusing on special needs. CDD conducts training in partnership and collaboration with stakeholders such as support agencies (Handicap International, Christoffel Blinden Mission, Action Aid Bangladesh, Plan Bangladesh, Save the Children Sweden, Sightsavers Bangladesh), development organizations implementing disability programmes, the NFOWD, concerned government departments, etc. Inclusive education training for different stakeholders is also a part of these training programs. CDD offers a 10-day course for teachers that cover disability issues. A six-day refresher course is also available. CDD also developed the Basic Education Kit to Access in School (BEKAS) in 2008, as a readily available set of teaching and learning materials to help schools promote Education for All, and in particular increase the educational inclusion of children with disabilities. After a few modifications and field testing, the kits were sent to 200 primary schools in Rajshahi and Rangpur Divisions, under the project 'Promoting Rights and Access to Inclusive Education', supported by the UK Department for International Devel opment and Leonard Cheshire Disability. (Source, http://www.cdd.org.bd/index.php/inclusive-education)

## Sighsavers Bangladesh

Sightsavers has been working in Bangladesh since 1973. In the last few years, Sightsavers Bangladesh is promoting community-based rehabilitation (CBR) programme and incorporating activities to empower people with visual impairment and other disabilities to recognise their rights. The Bangladesh Country Office supported six NGO partners to implement CBR. Those programs aimed to ensure sustainable community development by building the capacities of self-help groups and community volunteers, and strengthening links with the local government. Inclusive education is one of the components of CBR program. The following table provides a clear picture of Sightsavers initiatives regarding inclusive education:

| Programme/ activities | Partner organisation | Key facts |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Education programme in Narshingdi District | Assistance for Bind Children (ABC) | Started in 2006 in partnership with the Centre for Disability in Development (CDD) and fieldbased partners such as Assistance for Blind Children (ABC) and Gram Bikash Sangstha. The programme is now being implemented with ABC in Narshingdi. Supports 76 children with disabilities (including 30 blind and 16 low vision children) in 35 schools (includes 31 government-run primary schools and 4 government-supported registered primary schools). 31 teachers (including 10 female teachers), 56 district-based primary teacher training instructors and 19 district-based Assistant Upazila (sub-district) Education Officers trained on inclusive education and basic Braille. One computer resource centre has been established at a school to introduce children with disabilities, particularly blindness, to computers and information and communication technology (ICT). This is helping to raise awareness among community members about blind/low vision children's ability to use computer/ICT for education, skill development and independence. |
| Education programme in Sunamganj | Voluntary Association for Rural Developments | Started in 2009. Supports 57 children with disabilities (including 37 blind, 12 low vision children) in 26 government primary schools (GPS) and 6 registered non-government primary schools (RNGPS) and 10 madrashas (Islamic religious schools). 35 teachers trained on inclusive education and basic Braille. One ICT centre established recently. |
| CBR <br> programme <br> in Cox's <br> Bazar | Cox's Bazar Baitush Sharaf (CBBS) | Started in late 2007. Supports 423 children with disabilities (including 32 blind and 105 low vision children) in 42 schools (includes 34 GPS and 8 RNGPS schools, run with support from government). 39 teachers and Primary Teacher Training Institute instructors trained on inclusive education and Braille. |


| Government <br> Integrated <br> Education <br> Programme <br> (GIEP) | MoSW, mainstream primary and secondary schools mainly under the MoE and (some) under MoPME | Currently 370 children with visual impairment in 36 districts. The hostels are only for boys, not girls. <br> 58 resource teachers and/or house parents/teachers trained on inclusive education and Mathematics for blind students, organised by Sightsavers |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Teacher training in various places | 3 local NGOs through their CBR programmes made contributions: Centre for Services and Information on Disability (CSID), Rangpur Shamajik Unnayan Sangstha (RDSS), and National Development Programme (NDP) | 19 teachers trained on inclusive education and Braille by CSID in Barisal district. 10 teachers trained on inclusive education and Braille by RDSS in Nilphamari district. <br> 9 teachers trained on inclusive education and Braille by NDP in Sirajganj district. |

Table 4: Sightsavers initiatives on inclusive education (Source: Sightsavers, 2010, p. 8)
d) Existing and potential linkages, coordination between Government and other's effort considering the rights of children with disabilities
There are several national coordination bodies that play an important role in developing potential linkage between government and other initiatives. Those are as follows:

- Access and Inclusive Education Cell (AIEC): Within DPE, a cell has been established named Access and Inclusive Education Cell (AIEC), responsible for implementing and coordinating inclusive education related activities. This cell is the focal point for implementing inclusive education in government primary schools in Bangladesh.
- National coordination committee and Inter-ministerial task force on disability issues: Initiated by the Ministry of Social Welfare, the national coordination committee and the inter-ministerial task force consisting of 18 line-ministries play an important role in making coordination related to disability issues. This coordination committee and the task force is a very potential platform to implement inclusive education.
NFOWD: National Forum of Organizations Working with the Disabled plays a collaborative role among NGO initiatives related to disability and inclusive education. Besides, this platform also has long history of having coordination between Government and NGO initiatives. NFOWD is a member of different national committees regarding disability issues in Bangladesh.
- Asian Centre for Inclusive Education (ACIE): ACIE is an international coordinating platform regarding inclusive education. The secretariat of this centre is situated in Dhaka, Bangladesh. This centre is a potential platform for conducting international collaborative projects, international conferences etc.
- District Disability Welfare Committee: In each district of Bangladesh, there is a disability related coordination committee headed by the DC of each district. This committee is formed under the proclamation of the Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act 2001. This committee is also a potential platform to promote inclusive education at district level.
Upazila Resource Centre (URC): Upazila Resource Centre (URC) [More then 500 in total] is a newly formed platform under the DPE for professional development training of primary teachers at the upazila level. URCs have an instructor, an assistant instructor, a computer operator \& an office assistant. These centres are potential platform for implementing inclusive education.
e) Prominent research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education
There is a huge gap in the literature that can reflect on recent empirical study findings or research studies having a strong theoretical or methodological standpoint related to inclusive education in Bangladesh. However, a series of significant PhD research studies is currently going on since 2008 in the Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia under a project titled "Inclusive Education Reform in Bangladesh" (Monash University, 2012). While searching for information for this secondary data-based study, this project was in special focus. Therefore, researchers involved in this research project were contacted to know about their projects. Besides, peer-reviewed international and standard national journals were also taken into account to find out prominent researches and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education in Bangladesh. The following Table (Table 5) provides a brief introduction to those recent studies.

| Name (s) of Author (s) | Year | Title of the study | Theoretical Focus of the Study | Publisher | Methods followed | Key Findings of the Study | Study conducted by |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ahmmed, Sharma \& Deppeler | 2012 | Variables affecting teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education in Bangladesh | In-service teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education | Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs | Quantitative (Survey method) Attitude Scale applied | - Male teachers are more positive than females. <br> - School support for inclusive teaching practices and previous success in teaching students with disabilities as well as contact with a student with a disability contributed in developing more positive attitudes of the teachers towards the inclusive education | Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia |
| Ahsan, Deppeler \& Sharma | In Review | Predicting teachers' preparedness for inclusive education: Bangladeshi pre-service teachers' attitudes and perceived teaching-efficacy for inclusive education | Pre-service teachers' attitudes and efficacy for inclusive education | Cambridge Journal of Education | Mixed <br> Method (Survey and Interview Method) Attitude and teachingefficacy Scale applied (SACIE, TEIP) | - Secondary level B.Ed curriculum contributes in developing pre-service teachers with more positive attitudes than C-in-Ed at primary level. <br> - Female teachers are socially deprived that contributed in their less confidence towards IE. <br> - 4-year B.Ed curriculum is not covering IE adequately. <br> - Teacher education curriculum and practicum schools require major revision to promote IE | Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia |
| Ahsan \& Mullick | $\begin{aligned} & \text { In } \\ & \text { Press } \end{aligned}$ | Journey towards inclusive education in Bangladesh | Inclusive Education policy and practice models in Bangladesh | Prospects, UNESCO's international journal of educational policies and practices | Qualitative (Systematic Literature Review) | - Policies require revision to overcome contradictory information, address IE adequately and properly. <br> - There are some success in gender education and stipend projects that needs more recognition. | Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia |

April 2013

| Name (s) of Author (s) | Year | Title of the study | Theoretical Focus of the Study | Publisher | Methods followed | Key Findings of the Study | Study conducted by |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ahsan, <br> Sharma <br>  <br> Deppeler | 2012 | Exploring pre-service teachers' perceived teaching-efficacy, attitudes and concerns about inclusive education in Bangladesh | Pre-service teachers' attitudes, efficacy and concerns regarding inclusive education | International <br> Journal of Whole Schooling (IJWS) | Quantitative (Survey method) Attitude and teachingefficacy Scale applied | - Secondary level pre-service teachers are more positive and confident <br> - Teacher education curriculums require substantial revision to address IE, sign language and Braille issues <br> - Female teachers are more positive but less confident towards IE <br> - 4-year B.Ed student teachers are less positive than 1-year B.Ed <br> - Previous training and experience on IE or disability contributes in developing positive attitudes and confidence towards IE among pre-service teachers | Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia |
| Ahsan, <br> Sharma <br>  <br> Deppeler | 2012a | Challenges to prepare pre-service teachers for inclusive education in Bangladesh: beliefs of higher educational institutional heads | Pre-service teacher education Institutional heads' beliefs about inclusive education and its challenges | Asia Pacific Journal of Education | Qualitative (Interview method) | - Teacher education curriculums require revision. <br> - Teacher educators need training on IE. <br> - Attitudes of teacher educators sometimes act as a barrier <br> - Lack of resources is one of the challenges <br> to pre-service teachers for IE. preparing | Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia |
| Ahsan, Sharma \& Deppeler | 2011 | Beliefs of pre-service teacher education institutional heads about inclusive education in Bangladesh | Pre-service teacher education Institutional heads' beliefs about inclusive education and its challenges | Bangladesh <br> Education Journal (BEJ) | Qualitative (Interview method) | - Institutional heads found to have a mixed type of beliefs-some are positive, some are negative and some are confused. <br> - Some institutional heads showed a conditional acceptance towards IE. | Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia |


| Name (s) of Author <br> (s) | Year | Title of the study | Theoretical Focus of the Study | Publisher | Methods followed | Key Findings of the Study | Study conducted by |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ahsan | 2010 | Inclusive education and the national education commission 2009: A review and some recommendations (In Bangla) | Inclusive Education policy initiatives in Bangladesh | Bangladesh <br> Shiksha <br> Samoieky | Qualitative <br> (Document <br> Analysis) | - Recent Education policy is a significant document to promote IE in Bangladesh, but it requires careful revisions. <br> - Only primary education was given importance to promote IE. Other layers are not giving equal emphasis. | Individual Initiative |
| Ahsan \& Burnip | 2007 | Inclusive Education in Bangladesh | Inclusive Education policy initiatives in Bangladesh | Australasian Journal of Special Education (AJSE) | Qualitative (Document Analysis) | - Bangladesh is not behind in developing IE policies, but behind in implementing those into practice. | Individual Initiative |
| Ahsan | 2007 | Mainstream <br> Education \& Children with Special Needs in Bangladesh (In Bangla) | Inclusive Education policy and practice initiatives in Bangladesh | Bangladesh <br> Shiksha <br> Samoieky | Qualitative <br> (Document <br> Analysis) | - Bangladesh is not behind in developing IE policies, but behind in implementing those into practice. <br> - Several strengths are available that can be utilised to promote IE. | Individual Initiative |
| Ahsan | 2006 | Inclusive Education Acts and Policies in Some Selected Countries Including Bangladesh: A Review | Inclusive Education policy initiatives in Bangladesh | Bangladesh <br> Education <br> Journal (BEJ) | Qualitative (Document Analysis) | - Bangladesh is not behind in developing IE policies, but behind in implementing those into practice. | Individual Initiative |
| Mahbub | 2008 | Inclusive education at a BRAC school-perspectives from the children | BRAC initiatives on inclusive education | British Journal of Special Education | M i x e d Method (Survey and Interview Method) | - BRAC inclusive schools contribute in positive development for all children. | Individual Initiative |


| Table 5: Prominent research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education in Bangladesh |
| :--- |

Key findings of the recent studies on inclusive education indicate that our pre-service and in-service teacher education require curriculum and policy reform for preparing teachers adequately. National policies still need to focus on some IE issues properly, female preservice and school teachers are still not much confident than male teachers towards IE due to socio-cultural effects, previous contact and experience with people with disabilities contribute in developing positive attitudes among pre-service and in-service teachers, our schools still follow a very bureaucratic system of management which is a barrier to inclusive practices and some other challenges include lack of resources, negative attitudes of staffs an community people etc. Hence, these findings of the studies have to be considered seriously while implementing IE in Bangladesh.

It is apparent from the review of the above studies that there are very few recent studies conducted in relation to inclusive education in Bangladesh. However, based on the studies found in this review, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- Studies conducted recently covered policy initiatives and the teacher education sector (pre-service, in-service and head teachers' perceptions) as well as BRAC initiatives regarding inclusive education.
- Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia and few individual initiatives are contributing through research studies to the knowledge level for inclusive education in Bangladesh.
- Faculty Members at Monash University such as Dr. Umesh Sharma and Dr. Joanne M. Deppeler are conducting the project related to "Inclusive Education Reform in Bangladesh". Hence, their expertise in inclusive education related research in Bangladesh can be used for conducting further research on inclusive education in this country.
- From the methodological point of view, it can be stated that variety of research methods were applied in those recent studies, such as:
I. Qualitative: Interview, document analysis, systematic literature review etc.
II. Quantitative: Survey, Social Network Survey, Scales (Attitude, efficacy and concern towards inclusive education, Leadership practice scale)
- Data analysis procedures followed in those empirical studies include ANOVAs, Multiple Regression and Thematic Analysis procedures.
- Scales such as SACIE, TEIP, DLPIE, identified through these review can be applied in Bangladesh for further measuring pre-service, in-service teachers and head teachers' preparedness/attitudes/confidence towards inclusive education.
- Articles were published in both national and international peer-reviewed high standard journals, which is a good recognition of the initiatives.
f) Challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh
A number of studies have been conducted in Bangladesh that focused on challenges and barriers to implement inclusive education as well as education of children with disabilities in Bangladesh. Some of those studies also tried to identify the causes behind those challenges. Themes related to challenges and barriers as well as causes extracted through reviewing those studies are presented in the following Table 6:
Table 6: Challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education

| Challenges and Barriers to Implement Inclusive Education |  |  | References |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Major Themes | Minor Themes | Causes |  |
| Enrolment barrier | School Admission | * Negative attitudes Non-cooperative school authorities <br> * Lack of teachers' confidence due to not having adequate training and resources | Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007; Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006; CSID, 2002; DPE \& CSID, 2002, 2002a |
| Screening of Disability | Lack of identification | * Lack of awareness <br> * Lack of screening tools <br> * Lack of resources | Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007; DPE \& CSID, 2002; UNICEF, 2003 |
| Dropout | Dropout from school after admission | * Negative attitudes Non-cooperative school authorities <br> * Large class-size <br> * Lack of teachers' confidence due to not having adequate training and resources | Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006; CSID, 2002; DPE \& CSID, 2002, 2002a |
| Gender, disability \& Education | Barrier to girl children with disabilities to access into education | * Negative attitudes towards girl children and disability <br> * Abuse (verbal/emotional/sexual) | Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006; CSID, 2002; DPE \& CSID, 2002, 2002a, Nasreen \& Tate, 2007 |
| Accessibility of the environment | Inaccessible environment for children with physical and visual impairments | * Lack of awareness <br> * Lack of resources | Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007; Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006; CSID, 2002; DPE \& CSID, 2002, 2002a |
| Teacher Development | Pre-service teacher education curriculum | * Rote-learning based traditional curriculum <br> * Traditional teaching learning and assessment system <br> * Shorter length of the teacher education course <br> * Non-cooperation of practicum schools (practicum schools are not inclusive) <br> * Lack of university-school cooperation <br> * Absence of alternative communication opportunities | Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007; Ahsan, Sharma \& Deppeler, 2012; Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006; Munir \& Islam, 2005 |
|  | Pre-service teachers' negative attitudes and lack of confidence | * Social stigma and beliefs <br> * Lack of training <br> * Traditional teaching learning and assessment system <br> * Pre-service teachers' motivation to the profession <br> * Theory-based course structure (Less practicum oriented) | Ahsan, Sharma \& Deppeler, 2012; Munir \& Islam, 2005 |
|  | Negative attitudes of teacher educators | * Social stigma and beliefs <br> * Lack of orientation training | Ahsan, Sharma \& Deppeler, 2011, 2012a |

Table 6: Challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education

| Challenges and Barriers to Implement Inclusive Education |  |  | References |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Major Themes | Minor Themes | Causes |  |
|  | In-service teachers' attitudes | To build up positive attitudes of in-service teachers, the following things need to be considered: <br> * School and community support to in-service teachers <br> * Presence of children with disabilities in the regular classrooms so that teachers can have experience | Ahmmed, Sharma \& Deppeler, 2012 |
| Leadership Challenges | Head-teachers' non-supportive role | * lack of authority among school leaders <br> * students' lack of acceptance, <br> * non-supportive views of parents and community, <br> * school teachers' resistance, <br> * limited professional development scopes <br> $\star$ limited resources, and physical environment <br> * Bureaucratic system of educational administration made the school heads feel powerless | Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007; Mullick, Deppeler \& Sharma, 2012; Mullick \& Deppeler, 2011 |
| Resource <br> Management | Insufficient resources Lack of community involvement | * Lack of funding, teaching materials, educational materials, assistive devices for children with disabilities, therapeutic services etc. <br> * Absence of strategies for local resource management through community involvement | Ahsan, Sharma \& Deppeler, 2011, 2012; Mullick, Deppeler \& Sharma, 2012 |
| Policy level challenges | Policies as a barrier to inclusion | * Lack of sufficient data <br> * Medical-model based policies <br> * Policies promote discriminatory attitudes towards children with severe disabilities <br> * Confusing and contradictory policies that support both inclusion and segregation <br> * Lack of inter-ministerial coordination | Ahsan, 2006; Ahsan \& Burnip, 2007; Ahsan \& Millick (in Press); UNICEF, 2003 |
| Family support | Attitudes of family members towards disability | * Negative attitudes, abuse, not permitting to attend school from family members | Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006; CSID, 2002, 2002a; DPE \& CSID, 2002 |

School curriculum School non-cooperation * Traditional teaching-learning and assessment, peer Ahsan, 2006; Ahsan \& Burnip, attitudes, teachers' and parents negative attitudes, 2007; Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006
 resources

## April 2013

## Challenges in Pre-service Teacher education perspectives:

Research studies confirmed that teacher quality is the single most important variable for influencing student achievement (Gustafsson, 2003; OECD, 2005). Teachers are, therefore, vital component for successful implementation of inclusive education in the classroom. Researchers (Bechham \& Rouse, 2011; Shade \& Stewart, 2001) have also suggested that the period of pre-service teacher preparation could be the best time to prepare them with more positive attitudes towards inclusive education. For doing this, pre-service teacher education curriculum has to be explored. Review of the above Table (Table 5) indicates that several research studies raised concerns in relation to the preservice teacher education curriculum. Hence, it is important to review the pre-service teacher education curriculums in Bangladesh.

Bangladesh has two separate programs to prepare pre-service teachers for primary and secondary level. At primary education sector, PTIs provide a one-year Certificate in Education (C-in-Ed) degree for prospective teachers. At secondary education sector, Government TTCs offer one-year B.Ed. degree for pre-service teachers. Besides, some universities offer 4-year B.Ed degree. The primary level teacher preparation curriculum has not yet been revised (last revised in 2001 and a draft curriculum is in the process of development) to address inclusive education (Munir \& Islam, 2005). Inclusive education issues are covered through additional one-day training. On the other hand, in the secondary level pre-service teacher education curriculum addresses inclusive education issues through a unified model that provides inclusive education issues including in different parts of the curriculum that was revised in 2006 (TQI-SEP, 2006). However, DPE is currently piloting a pre-service teacher education curriculum that offers Diploma in Primary Education (DPEd) degree for primary level teachers. This DPEd degree is going to replace the C-inEd degree. The following paragraphs present the review findings of both primary and secondary level pre-service teacher education curriculums in Bangladesh from the perspectives of inclusive education.

Attributes of pre-service teacher education curriculum for inclusive education in Bangladesh.

## Attributes of primary level teacher education curriculum.

Primary level curriculum at Government level offers one-day orientation training on inclusive education for the prospective teachers. This one-day training covers definitions and target groups of inclusive education, screening techniques of children with special needs, alternative assessment techniques and some environmental modification techniques to address diversity in an inclusive classrooms.

But the components in the original C -in-Ed curriculum remain unchanged as it was not revised since 2001. C-in-Ed curriculum is divided in to four modules. Module 1 is about 'Principles and Concepts of Primary Education', Module 2 is about 'School Subjects', Module 3 is about 'Practice Teaching' and Module 4 is about 'Incidental activities and Behaviour' and these four modules contains 300 marks, 600 marks, 200 marks and 100 marks in the examination. Review of these four modules regarding IE issues reveals following outcomes:
Absence of inclusive education related policy and legislative information. C-in-Ed curriculum did not include information related to policies or legislations focusing inclusive education. In the paper 2 of Module 1, Pre-service teachers are given the knowledge of child and human rights to achieve two learning outcomes- ' 2.5 identify the social values of the child' and ' 2.6 identify the human values of the child' (NAPE, 2001, p. 18). Review of this paper indicated that education as a human right, EFA, and gender-equity issues are focused through different international declarations in the Paper 2. But the declarations, policies and legislations related to inclusive education are totally absent in this part.

Absence of information related to constructivist approaches. C-in-Ed curriculum discussed about learning theories. In the paper 5 of Module 1, titled as 'Teaching and Learning Methods' mostly behaviourist approaches (Thorndike, Pavlov, Gestalt) of learning are discussed. Few description of the Piagetian Cognitive Learning Concept was provided at the end of the paper. However, the Constructivist learning concepts (Social Constructivism, Social Cognitive Theory) are absent. It has been found that the constructivist teaching-learning approaches address individual difference and individual learning needs that is very much consistent to the philosophy of inclusive education (Daniels, 2009).

Children with special needs are considered as "problem children"!. Attitude of C-in-Ed curriculum towards children with special needs is medical-model based. In the Paper 4 of Module 1 titled 'Child Psychology' some interesting observations are made. For example, Objective 6 of this paper describes achieving 'Know about the problems of disadvantaged children'. In addition, Learning Outcome 6.1 is about 'Identify problem children'; Learning Outcome 6.2 is about 'Identify disadvantaged children and suggest remedial measures' and Learning Outcome 6.3 talks about 'Determine problems of disadvantaged children and take remedial measures' (NAPE, 2001, p. 32-33). Besides, the curriculum (Course content 6) describes the title of this chapter as 'PROBLEM CHILDREN' (NAPE, 2001, p. 34). This paper also encourages practicing IQ tests for determining a child's abilities. It is apparent from the review that this paper is based on traditional functional model of disability that emphasized a person's limitations in the daily living skills and also on medical model that focused on classifying people on the basis of their physical, psychological and health related attributes (Loreman, Deppeler, \& Harvey, 2005).

## April 2013

Ignoring language diversity. Addressing diversity in different aspects of life including language areas is one of the values of inclusive education. In Module 2, a paper is offered on mother tongue titled as: "Mother Tongue: Bangla". (NAPE, 2001, p. 48). Review of this paper reveal that this is total disregard to the mother tongue of the ethnic Bangladeshi people who have their own language other than Bangla and also violation of the Goals of PEDP II and NPA II set by the government for achieving inclusive education (DPE, 2007). In addition, there is no orientation on sign language/alternative communication for children with special needs.
Poor practicum planning. Module 3 addresses mostly the Professional Practice aspect of curriculum (Practicum). Review of curriculum document reveal that no description given about characteristics of a practice teacher, no evaluation criteria is present for assessing pre-service teachers' practice teaching. This part did not give any direction for professional engagement of practicing teachers. Besides, no information was provided regarding addressing needs of children from diverse backgrounds. No ideas were given on how to make an inclusive learning friendly environment for all.

## Attributes of Diploma in Primary Education (DPEd) curriculum.

DPEd degree is currently at piloting stage and based on the feedback it is expected to replace the C-in-Ed program. DPEd is designed to provide school experience based preservice teacher education for primary school teachers of Bangladesh. In this 18 months long pre-service teacher education program, student-teachers would get opportunity to have school practicum experience twice. This program is aimed to Professional Knowledge, Professional Practice, and Professional Values and Relationships among prospective teachers. The DPEd curriculum is comprised of twelve PTI-based courses: Six Subject Knowledge (SK) courses (Bangla, Mathematics, EVS: Science, EVS: Social Studies, English, Expressive Arts), Five Pedagogical Knowledge (PK) courses (Teaching Bangla, Teaching Mathematics, Teaching EVS: Science, Teaching EVS: Social Studies Teaching English) and One professional course (Professional Studies, Teaching placement A, Teaching Placement B).

Addressing the values of inclusive education is an aim of this curriculum. However, the most significant criticism of this curriculum is that this curriculum did not blend the issues of inclusive education in different sections. There were scopes to address the values of inclusive education in child development and learning theory related units. Besides, teaching content related courses also known as professional knowledge related courses also had scope to focus on specific special educational needs while teaching a subject in classroom situation. This curriculum did not cover those issues adequately.

Rather inclusive education was considered as a minor concept and was addressed in a small unit under the professional studies course. The title of the unit is "Inclusive education, equity and special educational needs" (DPE, 2012a).

This unit just provided some information related to concept of inclusive education, diversity and special needs in students and information about developing inclusive learning friendly environment (ILFE). As a result, the length of the DPEd course has been increased and the scope of having more practical experience has also been widened, but from the perspectives of preparing pre-service teachers for inclusive classrooms the curriculum did not adequately addressed the issue yet.

## Attributes of secondary level curriculum.

One-year long B.Ed curriculum for secondary level pre-service teachers offer one module on Professional Studies (Pedagogy), 2 modules on Educational Studies (Knowledge of educational policy, theory and practice in Bangladesh), 15 modules on Teaching Studies (Pedagogical content knowledge of school subjects), 2 modules on Technology and Research Studies (IT and action research skills for teachers) and 2 modules on Teaching Practice (School-based practice). Review of these modules regarding IE issues reveals following outcomes:

Information related to values of inclusive education. In the Professional Studies (Professional Knowledge) modules, values of IE were included in different parts of the curriculum. The scope of this module describes:

> 'Trainees are also challenged to practice applying their expanding knowledge and deepening awareness of the different learning needs of individual categories of Bangladesh secondary students [rural \& urban, girls \& boys, able \& less able, advantaged $\&$ disadvantaged, majority culture \& minority culture]' (National University, 2006, p. 30).

Besides, two modules of Educational Studies also addressed the values of IE in different parts. For example, the scope of these two modules describe, 'In Educational Studies courses a number of educational concerns are consistently highlighted; these relate to the varying learning needs of Bangladesh secondary students [girls, boys, able, less able, disabled, minority cultures, rural, urban]' (National University, 2006, p. 47).
In addition, the course titled Secondary Education, Curriculum and Child Development of these modules one unit covered issues related to disadvantaged in the context of secondary Education in Bangladesh that addressed diversity issues related to gender, ethnic minorities, rural-urban poverty and students with special educational needs (National University, 2006, p. 49).

In Teaching Science course, IE was addressed by the statements:

[^2]Effectively teach whole classes, groups and individuals-within the whole class settings including those involving practical work in science-in ways that ensure issues of inclusion specific to the science classroom are addressed, all students are engaged constructively..(National University, 2006, p. 96).

Creating safe and inclusive classroom. In the Professional Studies Unit 6 while discussing about classroom environment, the issue of 'strategies for creating a safe \& inclusive classroom' was addressed (National University, 2006, p. 34) and in Unit 7 about managing large classes gender equity was covered the following way: 'Ensuring gender inclusiveness-practising strategies and monitoring effectiveness’ (National University, 2006, p. 34).

Presence of information related to both behaviourist and constructivist learning theories. The Educational Studies modules also have a course on Learning, Assessment and Reflective Practice, which included behaviourist, constructivist and social constructivist learning theories (National University, 2006, p. 54). In addition, this course introduced both quantitative and qualitative assessment procedures of students learning to the prospective teachers.
Teaching strategies to address diversity. The Teaching Studies modules have different subject-based teaching strategies in secondary schools. Among the subjects, Teaching and Learning Bangla Language and Teaching and Learning English Language are two modules. In both modules, importance was given in strategies and techniques for teaching students with different levels of language development and difficulties. Besides, in other subject teaching, issues of diversity were addressed adequately and carefully. For example, in Teaching Mathematics course prospective teachers were taught about how to learn mathematics by using Vygotsky's Constructivism techniques (National University, 2006, p. 91). Emphasis was also given to follow constructivist approaches and ensure educational needs in science classes related to 'gender, ethnicity, interest, and physical/intellectual/behavioural difficulty' (National University, 2006, p. 99).
A sound and inclusive practicum design. Two modules represent Teaching Practice (Professional practice) issues that clearly describe evaluation criteria for practice teaching of prospective teachers. These modules also clearly described the criteria for addressing diverse learners. For example, in the module Teaching Practice 2 practice teachers will observe, practice and receive feedback on teaching that involves...6. Inclusiveness: ability and gender [that will create mutual respect, equity and inclusion].' (National University, 2006, p. 44). Besides this part of curriculum also provided ideas to make Inclusive Learning Friendly Environment-ILFE for all in the practicing schools. Direction for professional engagement was clearly described. For example, Teaching Practice Learning outcome 11describes 'By the end of Teaching Practice 1 trainees will have engaged in personal and shared reflection of their own and colleagues' learning about teaching from all activities undertaken during teaching practice and record these reflections regularly in written form in a journal'] (National University, 2006, p. 40).

Recognition of language diversity. Overall, this curriculum well described the necessity of alternative communication, sign language and ethnic languages. Clear Instruction was given in all areas of curriculum to address diverse communication needs including subject teaching and practicum areas. Besides, the whole curriculum followed constructivist approach as well as mixed method of assessment (e.g. written Examination, oral Examination, reflective journals, portfolio) to measure the progress of teachers and also encouraged them to use it for students' learning assessment.

## Attributes of 4-year B.Ed curriculums.

Four universities in Bangladesh offer 4-year B.Ed degree for secondary level pre-service teacher preparation. These 4 -year B.Ed curriculums provided very little information and emphasis on inclusive education. Out of 40 courses in the curriculums, they included only one small unit (three 1-hour classes) in one 40 -hour course. This small unit only provided the concept of definitions and target groups of inclusive education mainly. It is, therefore, apparent from the review that the curriculum documents that primary level original curriculum promoted segregation oriented medical-model based views. Whereas, secondary level 1-year B.Ed curriculum included IE issues in every part it its structure and offered this program for all secondary level pre-service teachers. However, 4 -year B.Ed curriculum did not give enough emphasis on inclusive education related issues in the course. Several recent studies (Ahsan et al., in press, 2012) have reported that pre-service teachers at secondary level are more positive and have higher confidence level to perform in inclusive classrooms than primary level counterparts. One of the reasons behind such result was the difference in curriculum.

## Challenges for in-service teacher education perspectives:

Directorate of Primary Education-DPE (2010), as a part of the in-service training initiatives, developed a series of training manuals for training teacher-trainers, field level education officers and school teachers. The training manuals addressed inclusive education issues related to gender, ethnic minority, disability/special needs and disadvantaged groups. These sets of training manuals contain almost the same contents though the target groups are not similar. As the contents are almost similar, this review focused on the training manual used for training the teacher-trainers.

In the content of the manual that presented issues related to inclusive education for children with special needs, it has been identified that the manual promoted the 'social-model of inclusion' and also discussed how this model is different from the 'medical-model of inclusion' (DPE, 2010, p. 85-86). As the social model promotes to focus of abilities rather than disabilities, this part of the manual asked the trainees not to label anyone as having disability (DPE, 2010, p. 79). Moreover, the manual promoted not to identify problems in children and mentioned to focus of abilities and potentials of each child (DPE, 2010, p. 85-86).

## April 2013

However, the different other sections of the training manual gave a total opposite message to the trainees and promoted 'medical model of inclusion'. For example:

Table: 7 Review of in-service training manual on IE

| Page No. | Section of the Manual | Content | Remarks |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 7 | Course Schedule | "Explanation of children with special needs": visual problems, physical problems, emotional problems, intellectual problems, communication problems, learning problems". | The term <br> "PROBLEMS" is promoting Medical Model of Inclusion! <br> It has to be special need in vision, hearing, communication, learning etc. |
| 10 | First day activity of the training | "What types of children in schools are back benchers?: <br> - BHOTA SOBHABHER SHISHU (dumb children) <br> - KOM BUDDHI SOMPONNO SHISHU (children with less cognitive abilities) <br> - BOKA SOBHABER SHISHU (Idiot Children) <br> - SARIRIK SOMOSSAY AKRANTO SHISHU (Children having physical problems) <br> - DHURTO SOBHABHER SCHSHU (Clever child)" | This section promotes medical model and also will contribute to developing very negative attitudes towards the diversity of children. <br> Some terms are even very insulting! <br> This needs a major revision. |
| $\begin{gathered} 100,102, \\ 115-116 \end{gathered}$ | Differentparts of training schedules | Used the term "PROBLEMS" to address special needs | Promotes medical model! |

Similar information also exists in other two sets of manuals as well. Moreover, the training manuals provided more medical related information in the name of screening of disability. Research studies (Chong et al., 2007; Hemmings \& Woodcock, 2011, Martinez, 2003; Oswald \& Swart, 2011) have claimed that such training for inclusive education would contribute to develop concerns and negative attitudes towards inclusive education as trainees might assume that inclusive education would require high-level skills, increase workloads and excessive resources. Hence, the sets of in-service training manuals require a careful revision for promoting social model of inclusion among the teachers, teacher educators and education officers so that they become confident and positive towards inclusive education.

## CHAPTER 7

## Analysis and Discussion

This study aimed, based on secondary data, to determine the recent updates and the overall situation of policies, strategies, capacity, implementation and practice on inclusive education in Bangladesh with a focus on disability. The justification behind specific focus on disability was that children with disabilities were felt as the most discriminated part of citizens among all the disadvantaged groups. This study followed a systematic literature review procedure and explored that children with disabilities are still left in the most vulnerable and discriminated situation in relation to their rights issues including access to education. This section of the report presents the critical analysis of the findings of the study followed by logical discussion regarding the interpretations of the findings.

## Policy Initiatives

One of the aims of the study was to determine the overall policy status and strategic directions of government on inclusive education with a focus on disability. This study, based on the review of secondary data, found that Bangladesh is strongly committed to implement inclusive education as the country has been the signatory of all the international declarations related to human rights, equity, education, inclusive education as well as the declarations on rights of persons with disabilities. The reflection of the commitments were articulated through enacting several Acts and policy documents for all Bangladeshi citizens to ensure their equal rights in every aspects of life including education. Several projects were also designed to translate policies into practice. The functional definition of inclusive education for Bangladesh (Ahuja \& Ibrahim, 2006) was also developed in a very positive manner. However, still it is felt that focus is on the traditional medical model of disability, which tends to judge differing abilities of learners as deviance that need to be treated and handled separately from the mainstream (Loreman, Deppeler, \& Harvey, 2005). Such discrimination points out a child's deficits first rather than identifying their potentials and strengths and less interested in improving teaching-learning approaches to address educational needs of all children's (Ainscow, 1997). The conventional standpoint was plainly viewed when discriminatory clause was made against children with disabilities in the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 (MOE, 1990). As a result of such discrimination from the very beginning of the EFA movement, all other policy and implementation strategies followed the footsteps of the act of 1990. Even the most recent National Child Policy 2011 also articulated discriminations against children with disabilities through a same pattern used in the act of 1990. However, the Draft Persons with Disabilities Rights Act 2011 (MSW, 2011) has taken a strong position against such discriminations. If this act passed in the Parliament, such discriminations could be removed from the system through legal procedures. In addition to that the revised ECCD policy is also a very significant document for promoting inclusive education at preprimary level in Bangladesh. However, reflection of the ECCD policy is not adequately felt in the curriculum of pre-primary education of the NCTB.

In some cases, policies raised a confusing position rather than making environment inclusive. For example, National Education Policy 2010 (MOE, 2010), National Child Policy 2011 (MOWCA, 2011), Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act 2001 (MSW, 2001) supported both inclusive education as well as segregated special education system. But those policies and acts failed to clarify the criteria of selecting appropriate educational setting for children with disabilities. The policies did not provide any directions for making coordination and collaboration between inclusive and special schools. A previous study (DPE \& CSID, 2002) related to education of children with disabilities in Bangladesh indicated that education of children with disabilities were managed by MSW and there was no coordination between MSW and MOPME. Hence, policies have to make its position clear to bring all educational setting into a collaborative umbrella to get benefitted from each other. Another vital observation of the NEP 2010 is that inclusive education was not equally considered in every layers of education, which could be a barrier for primary education to practice inclusion. Hence, national plan has to be developed for implementing inclusive education in different layers of education.

## Strategies taken to translate policy initiatives into practice

The review of documents identified several initiatives of the Government of Bangladesh to promote inclusive education into practice. Specifically, the National Plan of Action phase II (NPA II) and the Second Primary Education Development Program (PEDP II) are two notable milestones of implementation of the values of inclusive education into reality. However, it was observed that the discrimination against inclusion of children with severe and profound disabilities into education, which was noticed in the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990, was also reflected in the PEDP II program. Besides, the concept of mild to moderate disability that was officially accepted in the PEDP II was not appropriat. The matter of concern is that PEDP III has also taken the same stand point that was taken by PEDP II in relation to children with severe and profound disabilities. Examples of Bangladeshi successful cases in inclusive settings are one strong ground to argue with the government to revise such discriminatory points in the policy document. However, development of some experimental models of successful inclusion of children with severe and profound disabilities could be an elegant way to convince the Government to revise this discriminatory section of PEDP III document. Without revising this section EFA goal will never be achieved adequately.

## Overall situation of children with disabilities

The study aimed to explore the overall situation of children with disabilities including nature, type and level of disability, number and their geographical locations. The review of secondary documents indicate that still there is no reliable census done to identify people with disabilities due to various reasons. Therefore, involving technically sound team of professionals, this census has to be done properly.

Data that are available showed that children with physical disabilities are the large majority groups. Children with visual and hearing impairments are almost in similar numbers. Then comes the children with intellectual disabilities and those who are in developmental disability and learning disability groups. Geographical taxonomy of people with disabilities does not provide any clear picture yet. Most studies followed a purposive sampling procedure for identifying participants of the study. Few studies that were conducted indicate that distributions of people with disabilities in different administrative divisions of Bangladesh are almost similar. Hence, for conducting any further study related to disability issues in Bangladesh, a carefully selected purposive sampling procedure has to be followed. The recommendation chapter of this study suggested a purposive sampling model for future studies related to inclusive education.

Involvement of children with disabilities into education is not yet satisfactory. Though the Progress report of DPE (2012) claimed the increase of enrollment of children with disabilities into regular schools, the percentage is still less than $1 \%$ of the total student population. The Government should be more caring regarding this issue. Despite the government of Bangladesh have success in enrolling female children into education through different initiatives, female children with disabilities still left in the hard to reach group. Besides, inaccessible school environment, teachers' negative attitudes, rigid school curriculum, traditional rote-learning based teaching-learning approaches and only number-based assessment systems are found to be contributing in increasing dropout rate of children with disabilities from education. There are three educational provisions exist in Bangladesh for children with disabilities: Inclusive education, integrated education and special education at both government and NGO levels. But there is no coordination and collaboration among those provisions.

## Other Services available and existing potential linkage regarding inclusive education

The study also aimed to determine what services and educational facilities and approaches conducted by government and others (NGO and private) throughout the country for out and in school children with disabilities. This study identified some serviceproviding bodies as well as some potential platforms exist in Bangladesh that can be supportive factor to promote inclusive education. Services provided by IER of Dhaka University, CDD, Sightsavers etc. can be some of the useful sources of support for future inclusive education initiatives. If a National Coordination Committee on Inclusive Education (NCCIE) is formed by involving all the potential platforms that could assist the government to make inclusive movement more achievable.

## Prominent research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education

Another objective of the study was to be familiar with main research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education. Prominent studies conducted recently on inclusive education covered the teacher education for inclusive education (pre-service, in-service and head teachers' perceptions) as well as policy initiatives and BRAC initiatives regarding inclusive education.

Review of studies found that the Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia and few individual initiatives are contributing through research studies to the knowledge level for inclusive education in Bangladesh. From the methodological point of view, recent studies followed both Qualitative (Interview, document analysis, systematic literature review etc.) and Quantitative (Survey, Social Network Survey, Scales (Attitude, efficacy and concern towards inclusive education, Leadership practice scale) methods. Data analysis procedures followed in those empirical studies include ANOVAs, Multiple Regression and Thematic Analysis procedures. Several tools have been identified through this review that has high level of calculated reliability in applying in the Bangladesh context such as SACIE, TEIP, DLPIE. Those tools can be applied in Bangladesh for further measuring preservice, in-service teachers and head teachers' preparedness/attitudes/confidence towards inclusive education. Articles were published in both national and international peerreviewed high standard journals, which is a good recognition of the initiatives as well as a very sound way to disseminate information related to inclusive education to global readers.

Major findings of the recent studies on inclusive education report that pre-service and in-service teacher education requires curriculum and policy reform initiative for preparing teachers for inclusive education. National policies still need to address inclusion issues properly and correctly in some cases. Moreover, female pre-service as well as school teachers are still not much confident than male teachers towards IE due to sociocultural effects. It has also been found that previous contact and experience with people with disabilities contribute in developing positive attitudes among pre-service and in-service teachers. Therefore, this opportunity has to be ensured while providing teacher training for inclusive education. It has been found that primary schools in Bangladesh still follow a very bureaucratic system of management which is a barrier to inclusive practices and some other challenges include lack of resources, negative attitudes, non-cooperation of different stokes etc. Hence, these findings of the studies have to be considered seriously for success in implementing inclusive education in Bangladesh.

Challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh
One of the aims of the study was to identify main challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh. Challenges and barriers identified in this study through review of other studies emphasized on accessibility, enrollment, dropout issues, teacher development issues, resource management and community involvement issues etc. For minimizing those barriers, efforts have to be taken to develop an enrollment policy, making school environment accessible by using local resources, train up school teachers to make them positive, modify and simplify existing curriculum without changing the goals of learning outcomes, involve community people and parents in the school program, help to change traditional teaching learning and assessment systems to make it more child-friendly and participatory

Teachers are considered the most important factor in implementing inclusive education. Pre-service teacher education phase is the most significant period for making future teachers more positive and confident to deal with diverse children in inclusive classrooms. This study reviewed both primary and secondary level pre-service teacher education curriculums in Bangladesh. Through reviewing the curriculums, this study found that primary level pre-service teacher education curriculum was not revised for long whereas, the secondary level pre-service teacher education B.Ed. (1-year) curriculum has been revised recently (National University, 2006). This curriculum is very inclusive friendly. The analysis and interpretations of the findings of this study raise some specific recommendations for further improvement of inclusive education in primary education sector of Bangladesh. The following chapter provides specific recommendations related to inclusive education.

## CHAPTER 8

## Recommendation \& Conclusion

Analysis, interpretation and critical discussion conducted on the documents reviewed in this secondary data based study conclude with several specific recommendations to make education system of Bangladesh more inclusive for all children including children with disabilities. The following paragraphs present the recommendations of the study.

## Recommendation related to policy initiatives:

* Discriminatory clauses in the policy documents (such as, the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990, National Child Policy 2011) have to be removed through revisions of those documents.
* Confusing stand point of the National Education Policy 2010, National Child Policy 2011, Bangladesh Persons with Disabilities Welfare Act 2001 have to be clarified further to develop a cooperative and collaborative approach between inclusive and special educational settings.
* The Draft Persons with Disabilities Rights Act 2011 has to be enacted in the parliament as soon as possible and public awareness regarding the interpretations of the act has to be made through different programs.
* The ECCD policy is a very significant document to promote inclusive education at pre-primary level in Bangladesh. Hence, this policy has to be approved and commitment has to be implemented at pre-primary level in Bangladesh.
* Pre-primary education is given high priority for ensuring early intervention for children with disabilities. The curriculum of the pre-primary education targeted to include children from diverse background including those who have disabilities. However, reflection of the ECCD policy is not adequately felt in the curriculum of pre-primary education of the NCTB. As early intervention for children with disabilities is considered as the most notable requirement at pre-primary stage for the development of children with disabilities, the pre-primary education curriculum implementation needs to from an addressing those early intervention issues related through the curriculum. Moreover, some educational materials, teacher guidebook, early screening and intervention guidebook development is also necessary for making inclusion effective for children with disabilities at pre-primary education.
* From the review of literature, it is apparent that a National Plan of Action on Inclusive Education (NPAIE) is a must to develop a nation-wide coordination and collaboration regarding inclusive education movements for reducing inconsistency in practices.


## Recommendations related to strategies taken

* As a continuation of the inequitable trends found in the Compulsory Primary Education Act 1990 and PEDP II program, PEDP III has also taken a discriminatory position against including children with severe and profound disabilities into education. This section must be revised to include all children into education.
* The concept of mild to moderate disability accepted in the PEDP II and PEDP III document is not appropriate. This has to be revised. The current concept considered the degrees of all types of disability as a general concept, but in reality the degrees of disability varies according to types. Besides, learning abilities are not correlated with disabilities. So, this concept must be changed.
* Design of some model examples of successful inclusion of children with severe and profound disabilities could be an elegant way to convince the Government to revise this discriminatory section of PEDP III document.
* Practical demonstration of inclusive education at school level is important. Models of inclusive schools already exist in Bangladesh need to be identified to learn from their experiences with a view to develop a more sustainable and effective model.
* Strategy development on GO-NGO collaboration and networking on IE is necessary.
* Appropriate screening tool and process is a prominent need so that the tool does not promote medical model rather it identifies potentials and abilities and educational needs of children with disabilities.
* A well-planned referral service is needed for confirmation of supports required for children with disability for ensuring their educational activities.


## Recommendation related to overall situation of children with disabilities

* Considering the demand of a reliable census of people with disabilities in Bangladeshi population, a national census has to be done properly by involving technically sound team of professionals in this process.
* The enrollment rate of children with disabilities into primary education is very low (less than $1 \%$ of the total student population). Moreover, female children with disabilities still left in the hard to reach group for education. Therefore, the Government should take more awareness raising initiatives, community and family involvement activities, training of school as well as SMC staff to increase enrollment rate of children with disabilities into education.
* Moreover, some attractive and innovative projects have to be initiated (similar to PESP, FSP etc.) for the sustainability of their enrollment.


## April 2013

* Some model schools can be developed to making inclusive education happen in reality. Model schools will provide special emphasis on making school environment accessible by using local resources, train up school teachers to make them positive, modify and simplify existing curriculum without changing the goals of learning outcomes, involve community people and parents in the school program, help to change traditional teaching learning and assessment systems to make it more child-friendly and participatory. Such model schools could be examples for other schools to make their schools inclusive.
* This study found that three education provisions (inclusive, integrated and special education) exist for educating children with disabilities in Bangladesh. A coordinating and collaborating strategy has to be developed for those provisions to get benefitted from each other with an aim of making all systems inclusive.
* There are 64 integrated schools in 64 districts and several special schools in every divisional town run by the DSS. Those schools can be converted into 'Inclusive Education Resource Centres (IERC)'.
* Non-government primary schools (including Kindergartens) in Bangladesh are not directly following the inclusive education implementing strategies that are followed by government primary schools. Therefore, an inclusive education implementation guideline has to be developed for those schools as well.
* There is a challenge found through the review of literature, which is related to getting an acceptable picture of geographical taxonomy of people with disabilities in Bangladesh. Therefore, considering the overall socio-demographic and cultural situation of people with disabilities in Bangladesh, this study suggests a purposive sampling guideline for future research studies at primary level for inclusive education. If organizations like Plan Bangladesh would like to choose schools for developing model schools the following purposive sampling steps can be followed:
I. Information regarding schools have to be collected from the Inclusive Education Cell of DPE.
II. Schools are considered here as Government Primary schools in Bangladesh.
III. Government provided inclusive education training to head teachers under PEDP II. So, schools have to be selected where teachers are trained on inclusive education.
IV. Government is running inclusive education program in PEDP III program. So, schools have to be in the PEDP III project area.
V. This study found that disability is almost equally distributed in all administrative divisions. So, schools should represent all 7 divisional areas of Bangladesh.
VI. Two (02) districts from each division can be selected. One can be divisional town and other one can be any other district town.
VII. Urban and rural setting makes a huge difference in many factors. So, schools has to be from Urban, semi-urban and rural areas.
VIII. Schools that have already identified school-age children with disabilities in their catchment area will be given priority.

Recommendation on services available and existing potential linkage regarding inclusive education

A National Coordination Committee on Inclusive Education (NCCIE) has to be formed by the Government through involving all identified service providing and coordinating bodies related to inclusive education and disability in Bangladesh. This committee can act as a catalyst in inclusive education movements in Bangladesh.

## Recommendation regarding outcomes of prominent research and theories about recent updates (theoretical/practical) on inclusive education

* Faculty of Education, Monash University in Australia are discovered as a potential platform for research studies related to inclusive education reform in Bangladesh. Especially, Faculty Members at Monash University Dr. Umesh Sharma and Dr. Joanne M. Deppeler are running the project related to "Inclusive Education Reform in Bangladesh". Hence, their expertise in inclusive education related research in Bangladesh can be used for conducting further research on inclusive education in this country.
* Several tools have been identifies that measures teachers' preparedness for inclusive education in the context of Bangladesh through reviewing current research studies. Those tools are translated in Bangla and have good reliability scores while applied in Bangladesh. So, those tools can be utilized for further research on inclusive education.
* Based on the major findings of the studies, the following recommendation can be drawn:
- Teacher education (both pre-service and in-service) requires curriculum and policy reform for preparing teachers for inclusive education. National policies still need to address inclusion issues properly and correctly in some cases.
- Previous contact and experience with people with disabilities contribute in developing positive attitudes among pre-service and in-service teachers. Therefore, this opportunity has to be ensured while providing teacher training for inclusive education.
- Primary schools in Bangladesh still follow a very bureaucratic system of management which is a barrier to inclusive practices. Top-down management system has to be revised to provide schools more freedom in decision making.
- Lack of adequate support from expert people is another challenge. Hence, mobile resource teams have to be initiated at local level to serve multiple schools.
- More scopes of idea-sharing among different stakeholders have to be created to develop collaboration and cooperation.
- Self-help groups also need to come forward to ensure the success of inclusive education.
- Collaboration among special and inclusive education practitioners is a must to ensure the sustainability of the change approaches.
- Challenges include lack of resources, negative attitudes non-cooperation of schools etc. Hence, these challenges have to be considered seriously and strategies have to be taken to minimize those challenges for the successful implementation of inclusive education in Bangladesh. Besides, more budget allocation is required to promote inclusion.

Recommendations related to challenges and barriers with causes to implement inclusive education through mainstream primary education system in Bangladesh

* Every school should have a holistic inclusion policy that would deal with all the challenges identified in this study including enrolment, dropout, resource management, teacher development, community involvement etc.
* Schools should have some easily replicable disability screening tools and teachers have to be trained to apply those tools. These tools will not identify "PROBLEMS", rather those will highlight special educational needs, potentials and abilities.
* Primary level pre-service teacher education C-in-Ed curriculum was not revised since 2001 (NAPE, 2001). This curriculum was found to be anti-inclusive. Then the Diploma in Primary Education (DPEd) curriculum (DPE, 2011c) was designed to replace the C-in-Ed for preparing pre-service teachers for primary education in Bangladesh. But still the values of inclusive education is not adequately addresses in areas of Dip in Ed curriculum whereas, the secondary level pre-service teacher education B.Ed. (1-year) curriculum has been revised recently (National University, 2006). This curriculum is very inclusive friendly. This curriculum can be a model for revising primary level teacher education curriculum.
* The sets of in-service training manuals developed by the DPE (2010) for training the school teachers, teacher educators and education officers regarding inclusive education, require a careful revision for promoting social model of inclusion as those manuals currently promote medical model. Such model increases concerns and negative attitudes among people regarding inclusive education.
* The challenges indentified through this study again remind to develop some experimental inclusive primary schools that would be model for other schools.

From the above recommendations, it is evident that development of model schools, which can be replicable by others is the most important task now. To develop model schools, the reviews of documents indicate that the following issues would require key considerations:
a. Schools have to be selected by following purposive sampling procedures recommended in this study.
b. After selection of schools, the status of schools need to be explored, which will include attitudes and efficacy of teachers, perceptions of parents, students and community people as well as SMC members.
Next steps to be required include:
c. Determine target groups of IE in school catchment areas.
d. Exploration of physical environment
e. Exploration of teaching-materials and screening tools followed in schools.
f. Exploration of teaching-learning strategies and assessment procedures followed.
g. Identification of challenges and strategies to meet the challenges for implementing inclusive education in selected schools.
h. Exploration of resources and strengths available around schools.
i. Based on the above steps, design of future plans.
j. Training of head teachers, teachers, education officers on IE.
k. Orientation of SMC members and community people on IE.
l. Re examine the attitudes and efficacy of teachers after training.
$m$. Re-examine overall status of school components after implementing initial strategies.
n. Re-design new plans based on revision of previous plans.

## Conclusion

Noble laureate Economist Professor Dr. Amartya Sen in his famous book titled Identity and violence: The illusion of destiny, published in 2006 explained an important aspect of life, which he named "Plurality of Identity". While explaining the concept, he articulated,
'In our normal lives, we see ourselves as members of a variety of groups-we belong to all of them. A person's citizenship, residence, geographic origin, gender, class, politics, profession, employment, food habits, sports interests, taste in music, social commitments, etc., make us members of a variety of groups. Each of these collectivities, to all of which this person simultaneously belongs, gives her a particular identity. None of them can be taken to be the person's only identity or singular membership category' (Sen, 2006, p.4-5).
If we are to experience a world without discrimination and a world without social injustice and violence, we have to explore such diversity in our own identity. For doing this there is no alternative to include children from diverse backgrounds into same classrooms. Hence, we can expect that the future generations would be developed with an inclusive mind, who will positively accept and respect any sort of diversity among other people and would be able to find some common identity in others. Only a well-designed inclusive primary education program can develop future citizens of a country having such tolerant mind. This study was a small effort to make our primary education system more inclusive. If the recommendations of this study are considered seriously, it is believed that our education system would be much more inclusive in the coming future.

## April 2013

## References

ACIE (2012). Monsur ahmed choudhuri: A visionary without sight. Retrieved October 25, 2012 from www.ac-ie.org
Ahmmed, Sharma \& Deppeler (2012). Variables affecting teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education in Bangladesh. Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs, 12 (3), 132-140.

Ahsan, M. T. (2006). Inclusive education acts and policies in some selected countries including Bangladesh: A review. Bangladesh Education Journal, 5(1), 53-68.

Ahsan, M. Tariq (2007). Mainstream Education \& Children with Special Needs in Bangladesh (In bangla). Bangladesh Shiksha Samoieky, 4 (1), 7-14.

Ahsan, M. T. (2010). Inclusive education and the national education commission 2009: A review and some recommendations (In Bangla). Bangladesh Shiksha Samoieky, 7 (2), 55-65.

Ahsan, M. T., \& Burnip, L. (2007). Inclusive education in Bangladesh. Australasian Journal of Special Education, 31(1), 61-71.
Ahsan, M. T., Deppeler J. \& Sharma, U. (In review). Predicting teachers' preparedness for inclusive education: Bangladeshi pre-service teachers' attitudes and perceived teaching-efficacy for inclusive education. Cambridge Journal of Education.
Ahsan, M. T. \& Mullick, J. (In press). Journey towards inclusive education in Bangladesh: Policies and reform initiatives. Prospects.

Ahsan, M. T., Sharma, U., Deppeler, J. (2012). Exploring pre-service teachers'perceived teaching-efficacy, attitudes and concerns about inclusive education in Bangladesh. International Journal of Whole Schooling, 8 (2), 1-20.

Ahsan, M. T., Sharma, U., Deppeler, J. (2012a) Challenges to prepare pre-service teachers for inclusive education in Bangladesh: beliefs of higher educational institutional heads. Asia Pacific Journal of Education (APJE), 32 (2); 1-17. Available at: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/02188791.2012.655372
Ahsan, M. T., Sharma, U., Deppeler, J. (2011). Beliefs of pre-service teacher education institutional heads about inclusive education in Bangladesh. Bangladesh Education Journal, 10 (1), 9-29. Available at: http://www.bafed.net/ejournals.php

Ahuja A. \& Ibrahim M. D. (2006). An assessment of inclusive education in Bangladesh. Dhaka: UNESCO-Dhaka.

Ainscow, M. (1997).Towards inclusive schooling. British Journal of Special Education, 24 (1), 3-6.

Ainscow, M. (2005). Developing inclusive education systems: What are the levers for change? Journal of Educational Change 6: 109-124.
Avramidis, E., \& Norwich, B. (2002). Teachers' attitudes towards integration/inclusion: A review of the literature. Journal of Special Needs Education, 17(2), 129-147.
Bechham, N. and Rouse, M. (2011).Student teachers'attitudes and beliefs about inclusion and inclusive practice.Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs. doi: 10.1111/j.1471-3802.2010.01194.x

Booth, T., Nes, K., \& StrØmstad, M. (2003). Developing inclusive teacher education: Introduction. In T. Booth, K. Nes \& M. StrØmstad (Eds.), Developing inclusive teacher education. NY: RoutledgeFalmer.
Chong, S.C.S., Forlin, C., \& Lan, A.M. (2007). The influence of an inclusive education course on attitude change of pre-service secondary teachers in Hong Kong. Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 35(2), 161-179.
Cohen, L., Manion, L., \& Morrison, K. (2007). Research methods in education (6th Ed.). London: Routledge.
CSID (1999). Situation Analysis and need assessment of Street Children with Disabilities of Dhaka City. Dhaka: CSID.
Centre for Services and Information on Disability-CSID (1999a). Situation of Persons with Disability at the time of Natural Disaster. Dhaka: CSID.
CSID (2002). The Feminine Dimension of Disability: A study on the situation analysis of adolescent girls and women with disabilities in Bangladesh, Dhaka: CSID.
CSID (2002a). Employment Situation of People with Disabilities in Bangladesh. Dhaka: CSID
Creswell, J. W. (2008). Educational research: Planning conducting and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research. NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall.
Daniels, H. (2009). Vygotsky and inclusion. In P. Hick, R. Kershner, \& P.T. Farrell (Eds.), Psychology for inclusive education (pp. 24-37). London: Routledge.
DPE (2005). Second primary education development programme (PEDP II): Situational analysis, strategies and action plan for mainstreaming special needs children's education. Dhaka: DPE.
DPE (2006). Innovation grants manual. Dhaka: Second Primary Education Development Program (PEDP-II), Directorate of Primary Education.
DPE (2007). PEDP-II progress. Retrieved 14 September, 2008, from http://www.dpe.gov.bd/pdf/ProgressReportDecember2007.pdf
DPE (2009). Bangladesh primary education: Annual sector performance report 2009. Dhaka: Directorate of Primary Education, Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.

## April 2013

DPE (2010). Training manual for teacher trainers: Inclusive education. Dhaka: DPE. DPE (2011). Report on primary school census 2010. Dhaka: DPE

DPE (2011a). Third primary education development programme (PEDP3): Main document. Dhaka: DPE.
DPE (2011b). Third primary education development programme (PEDP3): Implementation guide. Dhaka: DPE.
DPE (2011c). Third primary education development programme (PEDP3): Annexes. Dhaka: DPE.

DPE (2012). Bangladesh primary education annual sector performance report (ASPR2012). Dhaka: DPE

DPE (2012a). Framework for a diploma in primary education (DPEp). Dhaka: DPE.
DPE \& CSID. (2002). Educating children in difficult circumstances: Children with disabilities. Dhaka: CSID.

DSHE (2010).Achievements in last twenty four months: January 2009 to December 2010 (M. T. Ahsan, Trans.).

DSHE (2011). Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education: Introduction.
Forlin, C. (2008). Education reform for inclusion in the Asia-Pacific region: What about teacher education. In C. Forlin \& M.-G. J. Lian (Eds.), Reform, inclusion and teacher education. Oxon: Routledge Tailor and Francis.
Forlin, C. (2010). Reforming teacher education for inclusion. In C. Forlin (Eds.), Teacher education for inclusion: Changing paradigms and innovative approaches. Oxon: Routledge Tailor and Francis.

Forlin, C. Cedillo, I. G. and Romero-Contreras, S. (2010). Inclusion in Mexico: Ensuring supportive attitudes by newly graduate teachers. International Journal of Inclusive Education, 14(7), 723-739.

Forlin, C., Loreman, T., Sharma, U., \& Earle, C. (2009). Demographic differences in changing pre-service teachers' attitudes, sentiments and concerns about inclusive education. International Journal of Inclusive Education, 13(2), 195-209.
Gustafsson, U. (2003). Can literacy lead to development?: a case study in literacy, adult education, and economic development in India. Texas: University of Texas, Lingua Links library.
Hemmings, B. \& Woodcock, S. (2011). Preservice teachers'views of inclusive education: A content analysis. Australasian Journal of Special Education, 35 (2), 103-116.

IER (2010). Inclusion of a girl with severe hearing impairment in education. Presentation in the proceedings of the international conference on child friendly inclusive education 2010. IER, University of Dhaka.

JICA. (2002). Country Profile on Disability: People's Republic of Bangladesh. Dhaka: JICA. Kim, J (2011). Influence of teacher preparation programs on preservice teachers' attitudes toward inclusion. International Journal of Inclusive Education, 15 (3), 355-377.

Loreman, T., Deppeler, J., \& Harvey, D. (2005).Inclusive education: A practical guide to supporting diversity in the classroom. NSW, Australia: Allen \& Unwin.
Mahbub, T. (2008).Inclusive education at a BRAC school perspectives from the children. British Journal of Special Education, 35(1), 33-41.
Martinez, R. S. (2003). Impact of a graduate class on attitudes towards inclusion, perceived teaching efficacy and knowledge about adapting instruction for children with disabilities in inclusive settings. Teacher Development, 7(3), 473-494.

Ministry of Law Justice \& Parliamentary Affairs. (2000). The constitution of the people's republic of Bangladesh. Dhaka: BG Press.

MOE (2010).The national education policy 2010. Dhaka: The Government of Bangladesh. MOPME (1990).The compulsory primary education act 1990. Dhaka: MOPME.
MOPME (2003).Learning for change: Education for all national plan of action (20032015). Dhaka: Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME), Government of the Peoples' Republic of Bangladesh.
MOWCA. (2011). The national child policy 2011. Dhaka: Government of Bangladesh.
MOWCA (2012). Revised Comprehensive Early Childhood Care and Development Policy (In Bangla). Dhaka: MOWCA.
MSW (2001).The Bangladesh persons with disabilities welfare act 2001. Dhaka: BG Press.
Mullick, J., \& Deppeler, J. (2011). Accountability and leadership practices in Bangladeshi schools: A supportive approach for implementing inclusive education policy? The International Journal of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences, 6(3), 275-288.

Mullick, J., Deppeler, J., \& Sharma, U. (2012). The leadership practice structure in regular primary schools involved in inclusive education reform in Bangladesh. The International Journal of Learning, 18 (11), 67-82.

Mullick, J., Deppeler, J., \& Sharma, U. (2012a). Inclusive education reform in primary school of Bangladesh: Leadership challenges and possible strategies to address the challenges. International Journal of Whole Schooling, 8 (1), 1-20.
Mullick, J., Sharma, U., \& Deppeler, J. (2012). School teachers'perception about distributed leadership practices for inclusive education in primary schools in Bangladesh. School Leadership and Management.doi: 10.1080/13632434.2012.723615

Munir, S.Z., \& Islam, M.R. (2005). Analysis and modification of the certificate in education curriculum of the primary training institute incorporating components of inclusive education. Dhaka: UNESCO.

## April 2013

NAPE (2001). Curriculum and syllabus of C-IN-ED course (revised). Mymensingh: NAPE. NCTB (2011). Pre-primary education curriculum (in Bangla). Dhaka: NCTB.
Nasreen, M., \& Tate, S. (2007). Social inclusion: Gender and equity in education SWAPs in South Asia, Bangladesh case study. Kathmandu: UNICEF.
National University. (2006). Bachelor of Education Curriculum. Gazipur, Dhaka: National University.
NFOWD. (2001). Bangladesh persons with disabilities welfare act-2001: Functional english version. Dhaka: NFOWD.
OECD (2005). Teachers Matter: Attracting, developing and retaining effective teachers Paris: OECD Publishing.

OHCHR (2007). Convention on the Rights of the Child. Retrieved October 18, 2012 from http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/crc.htm

Oswald, M. \& Swart, E. (2011).Addressing South African pre-service teachers' sentiments, attitudes and concerns regarding inclusive education. International Journal of Disability, Development and Education, 58 (4), 389-403.
Rose, R., Shevlin, M., Winter, E, \& O'Raw, P. (2010). Special and inclusive education in the Republic of Ireland: reviewing the literature from 2000 to 2009. European Journal of Special Needs Education, 25 (4) 357-371
Raynor, J. \& Wesson, K. (2006).The girls'stipend program in Bangladesh.Journal of Education for International Development. 2(2), 1-12. http://www.equip123.net/ JEID /articles/3/Girls'StipendPrograminBangladesh.pdf
Sarker, P., \& Davey, G. (2007). Exclusion of indigenous children from primary education in the Rajshahi Division of northwestern Bangladesh. International Journal of Inclusive Education, 13(1), 1-11.

Schurmann, A. T. (2009). Review of the Bangladesh female secondary school stipend project using a social exclusion framework. Journal of Health, Population and Nutrition, 27 (4), 505-517.
Scruggs, T. E., \& Mastropieri, M. A. (1996). Teacher perceptions of mainstreaming/inclusion, 1958-1995: A research synthesis. Exceptional Children, 63(1), 59-74.
Sen, A. (2005). Human rights and capabilities. Journal of Human Development and Capabilities, 6(2), 151-166.
Sen, A. (2006). Identity and violence: The illusion of destiny. New York: W. W. Norton \& Company.

Shade, R.A. \& Stewart, R. (2001). General education and special education preservice teachers'attitudes toward inclusion. Preventing School Failure: Alternative Education for Children and Youth, 46 (1), 37-41.

Sharma, U. (2011). Teaching in inclusive classrooms: Changing heart, head, and hand. Bangladesh Education Journal, 10 (2), 7-18.
Sightsavers (2010). Sightsavers'inclusive education work in Bangladesh. Sightsavers.
Slee, R. (2010). Political economy, inclusive education and teacher education. In Teacher Education for Inclusion. Changing Paradigms and Innovative Approaches, ed. C. Forlin, 13-22. London: Routledge.
TQI-SEP (2006). Putting quality into TQI: The role of a quality assurance framework. Dhaka: TQI-SEP.
TQI-SEP (2008).Inclusive education in secondary schools: A training manual for awareness raising of SMC members and head teachers (M. T. Ahsan, Trans.). Dhaka: TQI-SEP. TQI-SEP (2009).Inclusive education in secondary schools of Bangladesh: Resource book (M. T. Ahsan, Trans.). Dhaka: TQI-SEP.

TQI-SEP (2010).Teaching quality improvement in secondary education project. Dhaka: TQI-SEP.
UCIL (2011). Quantitative evaluation of Reaching Out of School Children (ROSC) project. Dhaka: TQI-SEP.
UNESCO. (1990). World declaration on education for all and framework for action to meet basic learning needs. Paris: UNESCO.
UNESCO. (1994). Salamanca statement and framework for action on special education needs. Paris: United Nations.
UNESCO. (2000). The Dakar Framework for Action. Paris: UNESCO.
UNESCO (2009). Inclusive education: The way of the future. Final Report of the International Conference of Edicaton (48th Session). Paris: UNESCO.

UNICEF (2003). Examples of inclusive education: Bangladesh. Nepal: UNICEF.
UNICEF. (2010). Bangladesh: Statistics. Retrieved November 17, 2011 from http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bangladesh_bangladesh_statistics.html
UNICEF (2009). UNICEF State of the World's Children. UNICEF.
UN Enable (2008). Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Retrieved September 17, 2010 from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/documents/tccconve.pdf
United Nations. (2012). The Universal declaration of human rights. Retrieved October 17, 2012 from http://www.un.org/en/documents/udhr/index.shtml
United Nations. (2008). The millennium development goals report. New York: United Nations.
Unnyan Onneshan (2005). Disability in Bangladesh: Prevalence, knowledge, attitudes and practices. Dhaka: Unnyan Onneshan.
USAID. (2005). Assessment of educational needs of disabled children in Bangladesh. Dhaka: USAID.
WB (2004). Disability in Bangladesh: A situation analysis. Bangladesh: WB.
WHO (2012). World report on Disability. WHO.
Appendix 1: Inclusive education issues in the PEDP III Gender and Inclusive Education (IE) Action Plan (DPE, 2011c, p. 12-21)

| Components | Inclusive education issues Speci | ic Recommendations |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Component I: Learning Outcomes |  |  |
| 1.1 Each Child Learns | - Teachers use screening tool and provide appropriate seating requirements for disabled children <br> - ADPEO (IE), URC instructors, AUEO, supervisors and head teachers advise and support teachers to accept all children without discrimination, ensure all are included in learning process and take appropriate action to ensure corporal punishment is abolished. <br> - Teachers use screening tool developed under PEDP II and provide appropriate seating requirements for disabled children. | - It is important that screening tools do not identify "PROBLEMS", rather those tools identify "learning needs", "educational challenges" etc. |


| 1.2 School and classroom <br> based assessment | No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered |
| :--- | :--- | | -This section can include 'alterna- <br> tive assessment approaches' for <br> children with special needs |
| :--- |


| $\begin{array}{l}\text { 1.3 Curriculum and textbook } \\ \text { strengthened }\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { Integrate inclusive issues and screening tool into teacher's guides and } \\ \text { provide teacher's guides to all teachers. }\end{array}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |

1.4 Production and Distribu- - No focus was given on either gender or IE issues. - Production of Braille books, books for sign language or alternative
communication users can be addressed here.

| 1.5 ICT in Education | No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered. | - Emphasis has to be given on use of ICT for overcoming challenges of special needs. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1.6 Teachers' education and development | - Head teachers, URC instructors and AUEOs provide supervision and direction to teachers to improve practice and ensure all children are included in the learning process. <br> - Revise classroom observation record to include tool to show levels of participation of students in lesson (gender disaggregated) and identify changes in practice. Head teacher and AUEO to provide feedback to teachers to raise awareness of practices and provide info to ADPEO (IE) to identify further training needs. | - It is not clear why selected PTIs are given responsibility to develop specialist teachers for children with disabilities when IE is to be included in all teachers' training curriculums. <br> - Emphasis has to be given to make practicum schools inclusive |


|  | - Focal points to assist teachers to identify and support children with low achievement and/or learning difficulties. <br> - Include inclusive practices in teacher competencies and Dip in Ed curriculum <br> - Incorporate inclusive issues into the needs based teacher training and provide on-going support for changes in teaching practices for IE <br> - Include IE teaching practices in orientation training for newly recruited and untrained existing teachers with strategies for inclusion of all children. <br> - In-service training to provide strategies for teaching wide range of abilities and backgrounds. <br> - Develop further training and capacity building of focal points (at school and district levels) to provide them with skills to develop system for identification and support for children with learning difficulties/special needs <br> - According to need at school level allow for local collaboration to draw on experience and expertise of NGOs working with specific groups. <br> - Selected PTIs develop and provide specialist teacher training for disabled children. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Component II Participation and Disparities |  |  |
| 2.1.1 Second Chance Education | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - Inclusive education issues have to be addressed by providing equal importance as gender issues here. |
| 2.1.2 Pre-primary | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - Inclusive education issues have to be addressed by providing equal importance as gender issues here. |
| 2.1.3 Mainstreaming Inclusive Education | - Nominated school focal points to assist teachers to identify children experiencing difficulties in learning and provide interventions to support these children in their learning. <br> - Screening for every child to be conducted on entry to school (Grade1) and in every grade once a year on Health days. Children identified to be referred to health specialist as required. <br> - Develop a toolkit to provide a guide to inclusion and strategies for identifying and supporting students with disabilities or learning difficulties to be produced together with a box of resources for classroom use for every school. | - Sounds alright |


|  | - Focal points to be trained to use toolkit and resource box and to offer increased levels of support to other teachers. <br> - AUEOs URC instructors and ADPEO (IE) trained to use toolkit and support schools in including all children in learning process. <br> - AUEOs to identify and keep record of teachers and parents in sub-cluster with experience of children with special needs. These to provide support and advice to others <br> - Systemic identification of need and development of specialist expertise to provide phased development of upazilas resource base to support sensory impaired children and offer more specialist support to children with special needs as required. <br> - Develop system to allow tribal children to be taught in mother tongue at least in pre-primary and early grade classes with Bangla being introduced in phased manner. Where teachers do not speak local languages provide schools resources to recruit classroom assistants to support children in their mother tongue. <br> - Materials for MLE developed by NGOs and CHTDF to be reviewed for use with tribal children from appropriate language groups irrespective of their backgrounds or characteristics to ensure no child excluded from attending school within home catchment area. <br> - Develop mechanisms to identify those children currently not counted those in remote areas, disabled children, domestic workers, street children and other marginalised groups. <br> - Ensure coverage in underserved areas, including urban slums through collaboration with NGOs and provision of single class schools in remote areas. <br> - Teachers use screening tool and provide appropriate seating requirements for disabled children. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2.1.4 Education in Emergencies | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - Inclusive education issues have to be addressed by providing equal importance as gender issues here. |
| 2.1.5 Communication and social mobilization | - Sustain and strengthen existing mass media campaign to raise awareness that all children have a right to receive appropriate, quality primary education within their locality. <br> - Continue to raise awareness through IPT, Education Week, Meena day, local programs on IE, poster campaigns etc. <br> - Introduce package of support to enable children in urban slums to access and participate in primary education. | - Sounds alright |

2.2 Disparities

| 2.2.1 Targeted stipends | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - While MSW is providing stipend support to children with disabilities in schools, why not include this issue in this section? |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2.2.2 School health and school feeding | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - Specific health issues and feeding requirements related to children with disabilities have to be focused here. |
| 2.2.3 School physical | - Existing buildings and toilets to be adapted for accessibility on needs basis. | - Sounds alright. |
| 2.2.4 Needs-based infrastructure development | - Facilities to meet minimum standards, be accessible for people with disabilities and be located suitably for both boys and girls use | - Sounds alright. |
| 3.1 Decentralization |  |  |
| 3.1.1 Field level offices strengthened | - Include gender and inclusive education objectives in field staff orientation | - Sounds alright. |
| 3.1.2 Decentralized school management and governance | - Hostels to be handed over to HDC on completion of construction. <br> - Resources to be targeted to counter disadvantage through SLIP and UPEP. <br> - Focus SLIPs on improving quality of teaching and learning, removing barriers some children face in participating and initiatives to support students with learning difficulties. Develop guidelines for School Self Assessment and provide key questions and criteria against equivalent standards (see above) by which schools can assess their own level of achievement. <br> - Identify pockets of disparity in overall enrolment, achievement and retention; and between girls and boys and provide targeted interventions on a local basis. <br> - Management guidelines to ensure children's wellbeing to be developed. <br> - SLIPs to include indicators for inclusion to guide discussion and planning. <br> - SMC involvement in ensuring all children enrolled and attending regularly. <br> - Identify procedures and strategies to ensure full participation and representation of all levels of community in SMC including women, and tribal and marginalised groups. | - Parental participation of children with disabilities into the SMC has to be ensured. |


| 3.1.3 School-level leadership and development | - Teachers and head teachers promote positive attitudes to minimise parental and children's stereo typing and discriminatory attitudes to marginalized groups. <br> - Head teacher competencies and training on instructional leadership to include IE. Inclusive orientation to be included in head teachers training. <br> - Increase numbers of AUEOs/URC instructors to provide one officer to cover 10-15 schools to ensure regular support to schools. <br> - Continue IE training for newly recruited officers. <br> - SMC chairmen provided with orientation training in IE. <br> - Schools and officials ensure corporal punishment and verbal abuse are not practiced and parents are informed that it will not be used. | - Sounds alright. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3.1.4 Organizational review and strengthening | - Implement plans with objectives to develop institutional capacity on gender and inclusive education. | - Sounds alright. |
| 3.1 Decentralization |  |  |
| 3.2.1 Grade V Terminal Exam | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - Issues related to examinations for children with disabilities have to be addressed. |
| 3.2.2 Teacher recruitment, promotion and deployment | - Teacher performance management system addresses gender based needs and inclusiveness | - Sounds alright. |
| 3.2.3 Annual School Census | - Routine data collection formats used in schools to be modified to record language groups of enrolled tribal children. | - Identification of children with disabilities has to be addressed here. |
| 3.2.4 National assessment of students | - No focus on inclusive education, only gender issue was covered | - Alternative assessment issues have to be focused here. |




[^0]:    The guiding principle that informs this Framework is that schools should accommodate all children regardless of their physical, intellectual, social, emotional, linguistic or other conditions. This should include disabled and gifted children, street and working children, children from remote or nomadic populations, children from linguistic, ethnic or cultural minorities and children from other disadvantaged or marginalized areas or groups.
    (UNESCO, 1994, p. 11)

[^1]:    Goals and Objectives:

    - Goals and Objectives 08 : Introduce mother tongue as the mode of teaching-learning for all
    indigenous and ethnic minority groups.
    - Goals and Objectives 10: Taking initiatives to ensure equity for all disadvantaged children including children with disabilities through enhancing required facilities. Educational Materials:
    - Providing Braille books for children with visual impairment. Solving Drop-out problem:

    Providing stipend to children from poor families.
    Ensuring separate toilet facilities for boys and girls
    Providing lunch in schools.
    Providing hostel facilities for children from hilly and other remote areas.
    Flexibility in school-times and school-holidays in wetlands that are affected by frequent natural disasters.

    Putting special emphasis on participation of girl children and ensuring eve-teasing free environment.
    and from the indigenous communities and writing books in their language so that they can get education in their own mother tongue.

    - Providing special support to children from indigenous communities.

    Children with disabilities:

    - Making schools disability-friendly through ensuring accessible environment and toilet facilities.
    - Emphasizing special needs of children with disabilities for consideration.
    - Training up at least one teacher-trainer in each Primary Teachers' Training Institute (PTIs) on
    disability issues.
    Street children and other disadvantaged children:
    Street children and other disadvantaged children:
    - Providing free education, educational materials, lunch and stipend facilities to ensure partici-
    pation of street and disadvantaged children.

    04
    

    Children from indigenous communities: $\qquad$ pation of street and disadvantaged children.

    06
    $06-07$
    

    Pre-primary and
    Primary
    Education

[^2]:    Identify students who have special educational needs (gender, ability, behaviour, ethnicity or language) to ensure appropriate learning targets, make effective use of assessment information about students (National University, 2006, p. 96).

